



**2025 Operating Budget Review
Finance Committee – Economic Development & Engineering Agenda
Room 204, 350 City Hall Square West
Tuesday, November 12, 2024
9:30 o'clock a.m.**

Members:

Councillor Jim Morrison (Chair)
Councillor Gary Kaschak
Councillor Fred Francis

Departments:

Engineering
Public Works Operations
Pollution Control
Planning and Development Services
Building Services
Economic Development and Climate Change
Transit Windsor

CLT assigned resources:

Jelena Payne, Commissioner of Economic Development
David Simpson, Commissioner of Infrastructure Services and City Engineer

Order of Business:

1. Call to Order

Reading of Land Acknowledgement

We [I] would like to begin by acknowledging that the land on which we gather is the traditional territory of the Three Fires Confederacy of First Nations, which includes the Ojibwa, the Odawa, and the Potawatomi. The City of Windsor honours all First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples and their valuable past and present contributions to this land.

2. Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

3. Minutes – Adoption of the minutes arising from the previous meeting

3.1 Minutes of the Finance Committee – Economic Development & Engineering of its meeting held October 15, 2024. *(attached)*

3. Delegations (if registered) (5 minutes maximum)

4. Business arising from the minutes

5. New Business (if required)

6. Motion to move in camera (if necessary)

7. Motion to move back into regular session (if necessary)

8. Date of next meeting (if required)

9. Adjournment

**Finance Committee—Economic Development & Engineering Minutes
2025 OPERATING BUDGET REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Date: Tuesday, October 15, 2024
Time: 9:00 o'clock a.m.
Room 204, 350 City Hall Square West

Members Present:

Councillors:

Ward 10 - Councillor Jim Morrison (Chair)
Ward 1 - Councillor Fred Francis
Ward 8 - Councillor Gary Kaschak

ALSO PARTICIPATING ARE THE FOLLOWING FROM ADMINISTRATION:

Joe Mancina, Chief Administrative Officer
Janice Guthrie, Commissioner, Finance & City Treasurer
Andrew Daher, Commissioner, Human & Health Services
David Simpson, Commissioner, Infrastructure Services & City Engineer
Tony Ardochini, Deputy Treasurer, Financial Planning
Tyson Cragg, Executive Director, Transit Windsor
John Revell, Chief Building Official
Matthew Johnson, Executive Director, Economic Development
Neil Robertson, Manager of Urban Design
Natasha Gabbana, Senior Manager of Asset Planning
David Soave, Manager, Strategic Operational Budget Development & Control
Mark Spizzirri, Manager, Performance Measurement & Business Case Development
Matthew Stubbings, Chief of Staff, Mayor's Office
Tina Moore, Executive Initiative Coordinator, Economic Development
Luigi Congi, Executive Initiatives Coordinator
Poorvangi Raval, Financial Planning Administrator
Steve Vlachodimos, City Clerk/Licence Commissioner
Anna Ciacelli, Deputy City Clerk/Supervisor of Council Services
Karen Kadour, Committee Coordinator

1. Call to Order

The Chair calls the meeting to order at 9:02 o'clock a.m.

2. Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

None disclosed.

3. Adoption of the Minutes

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak
Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the minutes of the Finance Committee – Economic Development & Engineering of its meeting held September 24, 2024 **BE ADOPTED.**

Carried.

4. Delegations

Terrance Kennedy, Area Resident

Terrance Kennedy, area resident appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and requests that the city take the area of pollution control and environmental protection more seriously; to acknowledge the dangers now in place and those yet to come; provides details related to air quality monitoring in 2022; and concludes by indicating that he looks forward to the opening of the new hospital, however, there are no environmental protections.

Nate Hope and Joshua Sankarlal, Members Activate Transit Windsor Essex

Nate Hope and Joshua Sankarlal, Members Activate Transit Windsor Essex appear before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and provide a brief background of their committee and provide details regarding their community mandate which was released in 2022, a survey with 620 respondents, provide key points including the frequency and reliability of Transit; the implantation of the Transit Windsor Master Plan; operating hours that benefit riders; and conclude by providing a brief overview of some of the challenges that exist including extended wait times at bus stops and bypasses at the transit stop which cause workers taking the bus to be late for work, people miss essential medical appointments, etc.; and conclude by suggesting that The Transit Master Plan is a positive step in the right direction and the city should provide stable funding to ensure a timely implementation.

Zachery Balough, Member Activate Transit Windsor Essex

Zachery Balough, Member Activate Transit Windsor Essex appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and indicates that he is an active user of Transit Windsor; and with the influx of newcomers and international students, the City of Windsor is growing at a rapid rate; expresses concern with overcrowding on all the

buses, wait time to take buses, Sunday wait times are increased and concludes by suggesting that the City should make significant improvements to the scheduling of the buses and undertake a review of all the routes.

Ching Yui Leung, Member Activate Transit Windsor Essex

Ching Yui Leung Member Activate Transit Windsor Essex appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and indicates he is an avid user of Transit Windsor; and concludes by reiterating that the population of the City of Windsor is rapidly expanding and there is a great need for transit as not everyone has a vehicle.

Councillor Fred Francis states that he appreciates the comments provided by Nate Hope and Joshua Sankarlal and adds that Nate has indicated that there must be stable funding to ensure that the Transit Windsor Master Plan is implemented properly and is asking for a long-term commitment. Councillor Fred Francis indicates that the budget for Transit Windsor is approximately \$17 million and provides clarification related to his reference to efficiencies. Mr. Sankarlal adds that since the Transit Windsor Master Plan was approved by Council, there has been less than one million dollars invested in the Plan since 2019.

Councillor Fred Francis indicates that COVID is not being factored in as there was a decrease in ridership at that time. He further states that the Transit budget has increased every year over the ten years that he has sat on Council.

Councillor Fred Francis inquires for direction related to moving forward with the Transit Windsor Master Plan. Tyson Cragg, Executive Director Transit Windsor appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and indicates that they have been successful in implementing elements of the Master Plan and looked at those changes in an incremental fashion. Mr. Cragg adds that in the Master Plan, there are several peaks and valleys – some years require an increased amount of investment to service hours and capital, and other years is a little bit lighter. Mr. Cragg indicates that Transit has been increasing service in the range of 4 – 6% per year for the last few years and adds that transit's net budget has increased 22% since 2019. In terms of a 5-year plan, they are open to that.

Councillor Fred Francis inquires about the correlation between increased ridership and increased investment. Mr. Cragg indicates there is a correlation and adds that in 2024, ridership on some routes has exceeded expectations.

Councillor Fred Francis inquires if ridership increases 40%, how is that shown in the fixed expenses. Mr. Cragg responds from a capital perspective; they have been able to incorporate all the changes within the existing fleet.

Councillor Gary Kaschak inquires whether there is tracking in the stats that identify the number of buses that bypass people, or the 40-minute interval wait time. Mr. Cragg

responds that on some routes they can track that information to know what their overload levels are and those are used as one of the many data points that are considered.

Councillor Gary Kaschak inquires about the increase in ridership being up 40% and which fare rate that applies to. Mr. Cragg indicates that there is an increase in student fares, senior fares, and regular fares.

Councillor Gary Kaschak comments that the issue today is the increase potentially to the Windsor ratepayer and inquires about discussions with the college and the universities as they are driving a great deal of the ridership and whether the school boards are contributing enough to the Transit Windsor overall picture. Joe Mancina, Chief Administrative Officer appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and indicates that the City has the Student Pass Programs both at the College and the University of Windsor and they work closely on establishing rates which are appropriate for the students and try to recover whatever costs that are associated with that incremental service. Mr. Mancina adds that they strive to have a recovery of costs associated with the student ridership but there are some limits to the ability to do that especially when you have significant uptake as the city has had. They continue to analyze what role those educational institutions have in assisting financially.

Councillor Jim Morrison indicates that the international student population has become a large component and requests that Mr. Cragg provide comments regarding whether Transit has noticed a change due to the policies at the Federal level. Mr. Cragg responds that they have not seen immediate change in ridership and adds that it will take some time to see those Federal and Provincial changes come into play. Mr. Cragg indicates that in terms of the student ridership, it is across various routes, and the need for housing has pushed students into areas not traditionally resided in, resulting in ridership increases across many routes.

Councillor Jim Morrison inquires whether Transit tracks how on time the buses are for the various routes. Mr. Cragg responds that they are in the high 90% in terms of service deployment. Mr. Cragg adds that there are times when buses do not arrive on time especially at peak service times which has to do with many factors including construction and detours and the overall condition of the infrastructure. If buses are full, it takes longer to load and unload which can increase pressure on the schedule.

Councillor Jim Morrison inquires as to what has been done this year to implement the Transit Windsor Master Plan. Mr. Cragg provides an overview of the various works that have been undertaken and adds that routes are being added on a regular basis.

Mr. Mancina provides an update as it relates to the administrative review that has been undertaken and indicates that the estimates to potential property tax increases have decreased to 7.37% from the original estimate of 12.9%. The finance team will be reporting back with further opportunities for potential decreases to the overall estimate.

Moved by: Councillor Fred Francis

Seconded by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

That the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering request that administration **REPORT BACK** to the Committee regarding Community Improvement Plans (CIP's), in terms of lost revenues versus return on investment.

Carried.

8. Business arising from the minutes

David Simpson, Commissioner, Infrastructure Services & City Engineer appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and provides a brief overview of the additional information report provided to the committee regarding annual reserve account contributions related to fleet projections/replacements and potential savings. Mark Spizzirri, Manager, Performance Measurement & Business Case Development, appears before the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering and provides information related to fire apparatus costs. Administration provides background information and details related to the timing of replacement costs.

Moved by: Councillor Fred Francis

Seconded by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

That the report of the Commissioner of Infrastructure Services/City Engineer dated October 10, 2024 in response to the Finance Committee – Economic Development and Engineering regarding the annual reserve account contributions related to fleet projections/replacements and potential savings **BE RECEIVED** and further, that this **BE REFERRED** to the Asset Management Plan (AMP).

Carried.

The City Clerk indicates that the request related to the Committee of Adjustment will be brought forward to a future Striking Committee Meeting for Council's consideration when necessary.

The meeting is recessed at 10:28 o'clock a.m.

The meeting reconvenes at 10:40 o'clock a.m.

10. Motion to move In-Camera

Moved by: Councillor Fred Francis

Seconded by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

That Rule 3.3(c) of the Procedure By-law 98-2011, **BE WAIVED** to allow for the Chair to call a special meeting without 24 hours' notice.

Carried.

Moved by: Councillor Fred Francis

Seconded by Councillor Gary Kaschak

That the Finance Committee-Economic Development & Engineering move In Camera at 10:40 o'clock a.m. in accordance with the *Municipal Act* s. 239 (d) labour relations or employee negotiations and s. 239 (b) personal matters about an identifiable individual, including municipal or local board employees.

Carried.

Discussion on the items of business.

11. Motion to move back into regular session

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the Finance Committee—Economic Development & Engineering move back into public session at 12:10 o'clock p.m.

Carried.

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the Clerk **BE DIRECTED** to transmit the recommendation(s) contained in the report(s) discussed at the In Camera meeting.

Carried.

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the memo from the Commissioner, Economic Development dated October 10, 2024 regarding a trade secret, technical, commercial or financial information that belongs to the municipality or local board and has a monetary value or potential monetary value **BE RECEIVED**, and that administration **BE DIRECTED** to proceed in accordance with the verbal direction of the committee.

Carried.

Moved by: Councillor Fred Francis

Seconded by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

That the memo from the Commissioner, Economic Development dated October 10, 2024 regarding labour relations or employee relations **BE RECEIVED**, and that administration **BE DIRECTED** to proceed in accordance with the verbal direction of the committee.

Carried.

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the memo from the Commissioner, Economic Development dated October 10, 2024 regarding labour relations or employee relations **BE RECEIVED**.

Carried.

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the memo from the Commissioner, Economic Development dated October 10, 2024 regarding labour relations or employee relations **BE RECEIVED**, and that administration **BE DIRECTED** to proceed in accordance with the verbal direction of the committee.

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the memo from the Commissioner, Economic Development dated October 10, 2024 regarding a position, plan, procedure, criteria or instruction to be applied to any negotiations carried on or to be carried on by or on behalf of the municipality or local board **BE RECEIVED**, and that administration **BE DIRECTED** to proceed in accordance with the verbal direction of the committee.

The meeting reconvenes at 12:15 o'clock p.m.

9. New Business

None presented.

12. Date of Next Meeting

The next meeting will be held at the call of the Chair.

13. Adjournment

Moved by: Councillor Gary Kaschak

Seconded by: Councillor Fred Francis

That the meeting of the 2025 Operating Budget Review—Finance Committee—Economic Development & Engineering **BE ADJOURNED** at 12:15 o'clock p.m.

Carried.