



2024 BUDGET CITY OF WINDSOR

Budget Issue Detail (Public)



Table of Contents

Administration Representation

CAO's Office..... 276

Finance & City Treasurer

Financial Accounting..... 280
Financial Planning..... 286

Corporate Services

Communications & Customer Service..... 290
Council Services..... 298
Human Resources & Employee Relations..... 300
Information Technology..... 313
POA, Purchasing, Risk Management..... 323

Economic Development

Economic Development & Climate Change..... 325
Planning & Development..... 329
Transit Windsor..... 335

Community Services

Fire & Rescue..... 341
Library Services..... 343
Parks & Facilities..... 344
Recreation & Culture..... 361

Infrastructure Services

Pollution Control..... 373
Public Works..... 375

Human & Health Services

Employment & Social Services..... 399

Corporate

Corporate Accounts..... 404

Budget Issue #	2024-0023	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Administration & Representation	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	CAO's Office	Category	[H] Line Item Reduction
Division	Administration - CAO's Office	Status	Public

Cancellation of Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) Membership

This reduction is identified as a potential decrease in order to provide options for Council to achieve their 5% target reduction. FCM is the national voice for Canada’s local governments. The Corporation of the City of Windsor has been a long-standing member of FCM. If accepted, this issue would result in the Corporation no longer receiving benefits of the FCM membership - including updates and information sent to us directly, exclusive tools and analysis, reduced rates at their annual conference, and direct influence over the federal-municipal agenda.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The 2023 budget for corporate municipal memberships was \$89,818. Corporate municipal memberships consist of:

- Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO) - \$24,230
- Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) - \$51,047
- Municipal Employer Pension Centre Ontario (MEPCO) - \$15,119

The 2024 membership fees have not yet been determined by the organizations above, however, it is safe to approximate an inflationary increase of 3% for each membership as per previous years. The proposed reduction of \$52,578 (includes a 3% projected increase in price for FCM) from the corporate municipal memberships budget is for the FCM membership only.

FCM’s programs and advocacy help secure new tools that empower municipalities to build stronger communities. Municipal leaders from across Canada assemble each year to set FCM policy on key issues. Membership provides access to numerous resources and communications, opportunities to provide input regarding advocacy and new funding, various outreach programs and conferences, as well as participation in the Big Cities Mayors’ Caucus.

What FCM does for members:

- Unites local governments of all sizes. With more than 2,100 members representing over 92 percent of Canadians, FCM is the trusted and respected national voice of Canada’s municipalities.
- Shapes the national agenda. With unprecedented influence and access to key federal decision-makers in every party, FCM drives historic investments in municipal priorities.
- Provides unique tools. FCM’s policy, government relations and communications experts inform and equip members so they can better serve their communities.
- Builds local capacity. FCM’s national and international programs—on everything from sustainability to reconciliation—offer funding, training and resources to communities.
- Defends municipal interests. Through FCM’s Legal Defense Fund, they intervene in precedent-setting federal cases to defend municipal jurisdiction.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
CAO Administration	Membership Fees & Dues	(52,578)				
	Total Expenses	(52,578)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(52,578)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0022	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Administration & Representation	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	CAO's Office	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Administration - CAO's Office	Status	Public

Reduction of Corporate Consulting Budget

This reduction is identified as a potential decrease in order to provide options for Council to achieve their 5% target reduction. If accepted, this budget reduction would significantly reduce the corporate funds available to deal with matters requiring consulting assistance which could result in delays to projects and initiatives which would have to be undertaken with existing resources in other departments.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The total corporate consulting budget is currently \$85,390. The proposed reduction is \$64,000.

The Corporate Consulting Budget exists to fund various initiatives related to public consultations, administrative reviews, organizational developments, etc. This budget funds initiatives from across the Corporation and supports ongoing improvements to corporate organizational structure and process. These initiatives also assist in the provision of information and advice to City Council as necessary.

This budget was reduced by \$88,850 in 2016 and a further \$20,000 in 2019. Initiatives funded by this budget are undertaken throughout the year on an as-needed basis therefore a large reduction of this budget would significantly limit funds available for corporate improvement initiatives. Some of the initiatives from the last 5-years funded by this budget include:

- Leadership Development Sessions for Managers
- CLT Review
- Corporate Strategic Review
- Council Compensation Review
- CLT Recruitments
- Transportation Planning Study
- HR Recruitment & Retention Study
- Annual Municipal Study

Administration expects to utilize the full budget each year. However, given timing differences and the fact that various engagements straddle the calendar year end period, administration annually requests a budget carry forward and manages the overall cumulative variance on an ongoing basis. Any reduction in this budget would have significant impacts and limit the ability to move forward with various corporate improvement initiatives.

5-Year History of Budget vs Actuals

Year	Budget	Actuals	Variance
2019	\$85,390	\$15,360	\$70,030
2020	\$85,390	\$64,833	\$20,557
2021	\$85,390	\$53,279	\$32,111
2022	\$85,390	\$36,246	\$49,144

2023	\$85,390	\$85,390*	\$0*
------	----------	-----------	------

*Projected

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
CAO Administration	Consulting Services - External	(64,000)				
	Total Expenses	(64,000)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(64,000)	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0231	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Finance & City Treasurer	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Financial Accounting	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Financial Accounting	Status	Public

Addition of One Permanent Payroll Control & Reporting Specialist

The Payroll department’s full time complement is currently not adequate to carry out work required to successfully process City payroll and accompanying necessary payroll tasks. Up to 2 heavy workload employees have been temporarily assigned to the department for much of the last 5 years to ensure all processes meet required deadlines and work is completed on time. Administration is recommending to add 1 full time Payroll Control and Reporting Specialist to ensure payroll continues to be processed timely and accurately.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The payroll division has 5 permanent Payroll Control and Reporting Specialists. Over approximately the last 6 years, there have been 5 permanent and heavy workload payroll specialists (heavy workload funded through the WFM project to address the ongoing volume and workload of the area) as well as temporary Data Entry staff.

The current compliment of 5 Payroll Control and Reporting Specialists will not be sufficient to ensure that payroll is processed timely and accurately. The department works overtime throughout the year, and staff are required to work heavy overtime throughout year end with limited opportunities for time off. Further, there is often a need for heavy workload assistance in order to meet required and legislated requirements. By adding one additional staff, there will be significant savings in overtime and heavy workload assignments.

Risk

There is an operational risk to continue with only 5 permanent Payroll Control and Reporting Specialists. With only 5 permanent staff, there is a strong likelihood that deadlines for regular pay will be missed or processed incorrectly. Further, remittances and year- end deadlines for T4s and other reporting are likely to be missed due to inadequate staffing.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	20,051				
Payroll	PC & Maint. Allocation	1,000				
Payroll	Salary-Reg.Full Time	60,750				
	Total Expenses	81,801	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	81,801	0	0	0	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Financial Accounting	Payroll	Payroll Control & Reporting Specialist	Regular Full-Time	1.0
Total:				1.0

Budget Issue #	2024-0199	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Finance & City Treasurer	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Financial Planning	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Performance Measurement	Status	Public

Elimination of the MBNC Benchmarking Initiative

Elimination of MBNCanada Benchmarking will significantly reduce the City's ability to benchmark our performance with our peers in key municipal services and will impede our ability to track our own performance year-over-year. Accepting this reduction will also eliminate access to the data and networks of our MBNCanada municipal partners from across Canada. MBNCanada is considered the leading Canadian Municipal Benchmarking program for municipalities across the country and the City has benefitted from participation in this program for almost 20 years.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The Municipal Benchmarking Network of Canada (MBNCanada) program is a voluntary, collaborative partnership of 8 single-tier and 5 upper-tier municipal/regional partners. The initiative is led by the MBNCanada Board, made up of Chief Administrative Officers and City Managers from all member municipalities and the partnership is considered to be a leader in Canadian municipal benchmarking and performance reporting. Given the emphasis towards Municipal Performance Measurement initiatives in the Province of Ontario, the City of Windsor joined MBNCanada (formerly OMBI) in 2003; and the Finance restructuring in 2006 placed this program within the Financial Planning portfolio.

MBNCanada member municipalities currently collect data on thirty-seven (37) municipal service areas and have approximately 700 measures in the data warehouse. All of the work involved in the data collection and the related peer review process culminates with the publication of the Annual Performance Benchmarking Report. The intent of the Public Report is to enhance municipal transparency and accountability, and acts as a communication tool to engage Council and citizens in demonstrating how well our municipal programs are doing.

Participation in MBNCanada meets the Municipal Act requirement to publically report on an annual basis, the performance of municipal operations. The benefit of tracking and measuring these indicators is that it highlights areas of potential corporate risk through the review of high-level performance measures. MBNCanada information has been relied upon internally to support business cases, provides information to support budget decisions, has been used by consultants as part of their service reviews, and has provided information to support corporate audits.

In 2017, an external audit was undertaken by PwC to identify how the Corporation uses statistics and performance metrics in managing and monitoring our service delivery. The PwC report - Manage the Daily Operations of Service Delivery noted that:

“Formerly the Ontario Municipal Benchmarking Initiative, or “OMBI” (now the Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada, “MBNC”) provided an annual report outlining the performance of the City against several others in Ontario. By providing information involving selected key areas of interest, the initiative compared municipalities against each other to allow each to determine how they compare to their peers. This is a helpful tool in allowing the City to compare its performance against others of the same size, or other criteria.”

While the benefits of having access to comparable municipal data from partners across Canada is certainly significant, the network extends beyond the data as MBNCanada provides an opportunity for municipal staff from across the country to collaborate, share their knowledge and learn from each other. Program participation has helped us to engage in conversation with our municipal colleagues about best practices and processes, and to gain information on how others have dealt with similar situations in their own municipalities. For example, the network has been used to gain information

on how other municipalities carry out budget consultations and what forms of citizen engagement are used to communicate budget priorities with the public, information was solicited from our partners on the Municipal Accommodation Tax and how each municipality planned to implement the program, and the Financial Advisory Panel is in regular communication with the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing in developing Provincial Financial Reporting requirements for Ontario municipalities.

Risk

By accepting this budget reduction, the City will no longer be a member of MBNCanada and will no longer have access to the performance metrics, peer data, expert panel network and the backend technical support that the Program Office provides. Additionally, with the elimination of the Corporate Strategic Plan reporting in 2011, the City will no longer provide formal, corporate-wide performance reporting to Council.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Perf Measurement & Fin Admin	Membership Fees & Dues	(18,900)				
	Total Expenses	(18,900)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(18,900)	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0252	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Communications & Customer Service	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Customer Service	Status	Public

Addition of a Digital Media Coordinator Position

Communication and public engagement with the Residents of Windsor is a primary responsibility of the Corporate Communications Department. More and more the use of social media has become a key method of that communication and engagement. An audit conducted by PwC found the City of Windsor social media accounts to be in good shape overall but also resulted in a series of recommendations aimed at taking the Corporate social media accounts to the next level in regards to procedures, controls, and strategy. When looking at the changing landscape for communication and engagement along with the way technology and automation will play a roll, coupled with results from the audit, a dedicated Digital Media Coordinator is being proposed as an option looking forward.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

Following a number of pilot projects between 2009 and 2011 Communications and Customer Service brought social media to the Corporation on a permanent basis in 2012. A social media policy was created with the following reasons given for the use of social media:

- 2.2 The primary goals of the City’s use of social media are as follows:
 - 2.2.1 Increase awareness of municipal services
 - 2.2.2 Augment existing corporate communication methods and processes
 - 2.2.3 Provide an additional mechanism through which the City keeps abreast of customer comments and perceptions regarding the municipality
 - 2.2.4 Disseminate time-sensitive information quickly
 - 2.2.5 Provide communication through the use of social media’s cost-effective tools.
 - 2.2.6 Correct misinformation, remedy mistakes, or alter services to build stronger relationships
 - 2.2.7 Develop trust and humanize the City
 - 2.2.8 Utilize social media analytical tools to help monitor, track and evaluate the City’s communications and marketing efforts
 - 2.2.9 Provide another method by which stakeholders can engage with the City
 - 2.2.10 Utilize social media as an additional way to collaborate with the public and other municipalities on mutually beneficial programs and initiatives

Since 2012 existing staff in the Corporate Communications Department have overseen the delivery of those primary goals, while at the same time, carrying out the other marketing and communications duties their position’s originally called for. Year after year, our social media analytics have shown steady growth and our department has pivoted well with the constantly changing/evolving demands, but as the social media usage and prevalence continues to grow and evolve, the time and effort needed to stay on top of, and get ahead of everything is becoming increasingly difficult.

An audit conducted by PwC found a number of areas where increased attention would benefit our Corporate Social Media Accounts, and while most are being worked on now, all could be better served with a dedicated resource. There is untapped potential with social media and having a dedicated expert focused on realizing that potential would pay dividends in engagement, security, performance and image. There could also be budget savings as social media is being found to be an effective means of reaching target audiences, while also being a cheaper marketing tool.

A dedicated Digital Media Coordinator would be responsible for coordinating social media communication activities for

the corporation, including composing, posting and monitoring original material on behalf of the City on its central corporate sites;

- coordinating paid social media activities (e.g. account creation and advertisements);
- responding to daily social media inquiries from the public across a variety of platforms;
- overseeing an annual review of the City’s social media strategy and its strategic application throughout the year;
- analyzing and reporting on social media data collected, including quantitative and qualitative analytics;
- reviewing trends in social media and recommending new platforms as needed;
- reviewing requests for and/or authorizing new pages from across the corporation;
- training staff who are granted social media duties;
- coordinating with partner agencies in community emergency situations;
- implementing improvements overall

Should this issue be approved with one-time funding, the position could set-up systems, introduce the latest trends, carry out instruction and further best practices. One year of funding would give our social communications efforts a strong step forward, and could be the year needed to confirm the long-term potential of an on-going commitment to this position.

Risk

Social media provides the Corporation direct access to residents for communicating information, promotions, emergency messages and more. At a time when traditional methods are becoming less effective, a stronger social media presence would be a major benefit to the corporation in communicating effectively with Windsor residents. The risk in not adding a digital media coordinator lies in the loss of potential growth in communication and engagement with the public that a dedicated social media expert could bring.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Communications Unit	Cell Phones	600				
Communications Unit	PC & Maint. Allocation	1,000				
Communications Unit	Salary-Reg.Full Time	80,569				
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	26,591				
	Total Expenses	108,760	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	108,760	0	0	0	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Communications & Customer Service	Communications Unit	Digital Media Coordinator	Regular Full-Time	1.0
			Total:	1.0

Budget Issue #	2024-0253	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Communications & Customer Service	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Call Centre	Status	Public

Addition of Two Full Time 311/211 Customer Contact Representatives

The addition of 2 full time Customer Contact Representatives is required to manage increased demands, ensure adequate staffing, maintain business continuity for the 311 & 211 services and support the health and well being of the front line employees providing customer service to our residents.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: If not approved, \$162,800 (Budget Stabilization Reserve)

Issue Detail

There are currently 9 full time and 4 part time Customer Contact Representatives (CCR's) which is the minimum staffing level required to meet operational requirements for the 311 and 211 services. This includes meeting existing service targets and KPI's; providing continuous intake service to the public; fulfilling our contractual obligations as a 211 service partner, maintaining enough trained staff to cover absences; capacity to respond to the volume of public inquiries received and mitigate staff turnover and burn out.

The Customer Contact Centre and the 311 service is truly an asset for the corporation and the community. 311 is the front door to municipal service for residents and the hub of the corporate service request system. It is a highly accountable public facing department with a very dynamic work environment subject to many internal and external factors.

The benefit of this asset was recently demonstrated during the COVID pandemic when the Contact Centre played a key role in the community COVID response. The Contact Centre was deemed essential and continued to operate with no interruption to service. To assist during that time, Contact Centre staffing was augmented with additional re-deployed employees which was pivotal to the success of operations. Significant weather events are on the rise, increasing both in frequency and intensity and impacting municipal resources and emergency services to a greater degree than ever before. The role of 311 as the citizen inquiry line during emergencies is critical to handle resident reports and mitigate calls to 911 so that Fire, Police and EMS can continue to focus on emergency response.

Societal changes have emerged post pandemic that are directly affecting municipal service delivery both internally and externally and are challenging the status quo. The 311 service is being further leveraged to provide a centralized point of contact for homelessness and encampment reporting and is expected to be directly impacted with upcoming changes to residential waste collection. The nature of interactions that our front line staff face on a daily basis has also changed significantly in the last few years. There has been a demonstrated increase of challenging interactions and an erosion of respectful and appropriate engagement which impacts staff resiliency. The CCR's have frequent and daily exposure to situations where the public may be emotionally distressed as well as exposure to confrontational situations which they must navigate while they conduct their duties.

Additionally, the Contact Centre has experienced staff gapping which impacts service and remaining staff. Although best efforts have been made to implement short term measures to address staff gapping, a permanent resolve is needed. During the 2023 Budget Development, Council approved one time funding of up to \$152,895 from the Budget Stabilization Reserve to fund two temporary 311/211 Customer Contact Representatives. This year the department is requesting the addition of two permanent (2) full time Customer Contact Representatives. Should this issue not be approved, the full amount is requested as one time funding of \$162,800.

As municipal service delivery is adapting to change and the trajectory for growth in our community is on the rise, the

opportunity to further leverage 311 exists. The addition of 2 permanent positions are key to ensure 311 is equipped to respond to emerging demands and continue providing quality customer service for residents.

Risk

Minimum staffing levels impact the Contact Centre’s ability to pivot in response to increased volumes and maintain existing operational requirements and funding obligations. The continuous volume of work, emerging changes in municipal service delivery and the heightened and sustained emotional demands placed on the front line Customer Contact Representatives has been unprecedented and has a negative impact on their health, well being and resiliency.

Performance Indicators

Metric	5 year average 2018-2022
Total Inquiries Handled Annually:	154,683
311 Average Call Abandoned Rate (Target is 5%)	5.2%
211 Average Call Abandoned Rate (Target is 10%)	8.8%
311 Service Level Target (# of calls answered within 45 sec Target is 75%)	77%
211 Service Level Target (# of calls answered within 60 sec Target is 75%)	76%

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Customer Contact Centre	PC & Maint. Allocation	2,000				
Customer Contact Centre	Salary-Reg.Full Time	120,902				
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	39,898				
	Total Expenses	162,800	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	162,800	0	0	0	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Communications & Customer Service	Customer Contact Centre	Customer Contact Representative	Regular Full-Time	2.0
			Total:	2.0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0093	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Human Resources & Employee Relations	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Employment & Consulting Serv.	Status	Public

Reduction of the Corporate Training and Development Budget

Reducing the Corporate Training Budget will assist in meeting the target reduction, however this budget cut is not recommended and is contrary to PWC's report on Retention & Employee Experience wherein PWC recommends more training be provided to employees. The health of the organization is dependent on a competent, skilled and well trained workforce. Investing poorly will undermine that effort and reflect high staff turnover, unskilled workers, low employee engagement, and the inability to attract and retain staff. A cost cutting measure of this size can derail potential future growth opportunities by not being able to develop the critical skills, knowledge and abilities needed today and into the future.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The pace of change post-pandemic will continue to accelerate at a rapid speed and it is estimated that jobs could be displaced by automation by 2030. Employee roles will evolve requiring a surge in training and development in order to remain employable. New and different kinds of skills will be sought. As a result, the organization will be challenged in becoming innovative, agile, collaborative, solution-oriented, efficient and effective if a healthy and robust budget cannot meet those needs.

Any reduction to the Corporate Training budget will hamper efforts designed to:

- Build high-performance teams
- Develop a pool of great leaders
- Build on technical and analytical skills and;
- Create a high performance-focused culture

Many of the training initiatives currently available offer insight, tools and resources for growth and development while others align to meet legislative compliance. Additional learning opportunities build awareness, knowledge and skills through diverse, inclusive, and equitable work environments.

A reduction to the corporate training budget invariably impacts continuous quality improvement, succession planning, leadership training, responsiveness to legislative obligations and cost-sharing partnerships with like-minded organizations in the public and private sector.

The competition for talent, employee turnover, replacement costs and skill gaps are creating significant challenges for organizations in their attraction and retention strategy efforts. Building a world-class organization with world-class talent cannot be accomplished with a reduction to the training budget, but rather requires a substantial investment.

Performance Indicators

Organizations with strong learning cultures exhibit better overall organizational performance in the areas of employee engagement, customer satisfaction, overall productivity, and overall leadership performance compared to organizations with weak learning cultures.

Organizationally we've come to a cross section where an investment in learning and development is a necessity if we want to thrive, attract and retain a talented workforce.

According to research published by the Conference Board of Canada, on average, employers in Canada spent \$1,014 per employee on learning and development in 2021. Using 2021 stats, the City is well below average with spending at \$161 per employee. It's important to note that an investment in training has a positive impact on employee retention. According to LinkedIn Learning's 2023 Workplace Learning Report 93% of organizations are concerned about employee retention. "Providing learning opportunities" is the No. 1 way organizations are working to combat that pain point. If employees are not provided with opportunities to grow, and develop new skills, they will pursue other employment opportunities. In fact, the top five factors when (employees) are considering a new job include:

- #1 Compensation and benefits
- #2 Flexibility to work when and where I want
- #3 Challenging and impactful work
- #4 Opportunities for career growth within the company
- #5 Opportunities to learn and develop new skills

Risk

"Organizations that invest in employee learning and development understand the importance of maintaining a strong knowledge-based workforce and keeping pace with dynamic, volatile, and ever-changing business environments." (Conference Board of Canada). Failing to keep pace amid accelerating automation and fundamental changes to work caused by the pandemic may put the organization at risk. For this reason, the reduction to the Corporate Training Budget is not recommended.

5 Year Budget History (External Consulting Account Only)

Year	Budget	Actual	Variance	% Committed
2019	\$163,474	\$175,716	(\$12,242)	107.5%
2020	\$173,474	\$106,647	\$66,828*	61.5%
2021	\$169,978	\$164,789	\$5,189	96.9%
2022	\$169,978	\$262,575	(\$92,597)	154.5%
2023	\$250,559	\$250,559**	\$0**	100%**

*COVID Related surplus
 **2023 year-end projection

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Employment & Consulting Serv.	Consulting Services - External	(250,559)				
	Total Expenses	(250,559)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(250,559)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0090	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Human Resources & Employee Relations	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Occupational H&S & Wellness	Status	Public

Elimination of the Employee Family Assistance Program (EFAP)

EFAP provides support services to City employees such as job, family and grief counselling, legal and debt management advice, and addiction and work-related stress counseling. This reduction is not recommended by the department as this benefit provides supports used by our employees and their family members when coping with the stressors of life. Further, a reduction in service will hamper a critical tool used by the Disability Management Team currently utilized by Managers and Employees to address longer term or more specialized levels of care for our employees in our efforts to bring employees back to work, further our PWC Employee Retention and Experience findings illustrated the importance and appreciation our employees have for this program.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: \$48,714 from the Budget Stabilization Reserve (to carry the contract through to March 2024 if approved)

Issue Detail

Union representatives, managers, and Human Resources staff regularly use the EFAP program to offer assistance to employees who struggle with many issues, but the highest emerging issues are personal/emotional stress and anxiety. EFAP services are recommended in situations where an employee’s performance is decreasing, when issues arise between co-workers, and when employees disclose personal conflicts be they with their children, spouse or partner, or caring for an elderly parent.

The increased availability of in-person counselling through our new provider as well as telephone counselling have been welcomed by our workforce. With offices located in Windsor, our new provider offers our staff the opportunity to walk into their offices and set up the services they need in a face-to-face exchange with Family Services personnel.

Trauma counselling has provided a unique, specialized service to assist our employees in emotionally challenging circumstances, such as the death of a co-worker. This service provided on-site for our workforce provides a direct lifeline for employees struggling with their grief in its acute stages. Once we make our way through the initial trauma, other supportive counselling services to assist employees coping with the effects of grief can also be offered.

Crisis Intervention Services provide critical assistance to managers, Unions and Human Resources staff providing the professional expertise to assist and assess staff in crisis who may be at risk of self-harm or harming others.

In addition to the variety of counselling services, the EFAP provider delivers a number of virtual lunch and learn sessions with topics relevant to the current challenges our employees and management teams face in these unique times. Topics of these sessions include: Understanding Substance Abuse, Mood and Depression, Burnout to Balance and Coping with Uncertainty.

A reduction in the provision of accessible EFAP support services, and convenient Lunch and Learns, will limit our ability to provide information and critical support to our employees. Throughout 2023 to-date, personal and emotional issues - plus couple and relationship issues have been the most frequent causes for our employees to utilize EFAP services. EFAP support services, and Lunch and Learns are tools to provide information to assist employees with the issues they struggle with and connect them directly with a representative of our EFAP provider for support for themselves and their family members, which in turn provides for a productive and well-adjusted employee.

Performance Indicators

Overall Utilization Rates:

2005: 5.8% or 227 cases: 0 workplace interventions
 2006: 7.6% or 244 cases: 7 workplace interventions
 2007: 8.6% or 277 cases: 15 workplace interventions
 2008: 8.05% or 260 cases: 3 workplace/trauma cases
 2009: 7.37% or 253 cases: 9 workplace/trauma cases
 2010: 10.25% or 352 cases: 9 workplace/trauma cases
 2011: 10.52% or 361 cases: 0 workplace interventions/trauma cases
 2012: 8.96% or 331 cases: 5 workplace/trauma cases
 2013: 9.29% or 359 cases: 5 workplace/trauma cases
 2014: 9.09% or 380 cases: 2 workplace/trauma cases
 2015: 9.53% or 417 cases: 8 workplace/trauma cases
 2016: 9.69% or 415 cases: 5 workplace/trauma cases
 2017: 8.51% or 377 cases: 6 workplace/trauma cases
 2018: 8.43% or 383 cases: 0 workplace/trauma cases
 2019: 6.13% or 283 cases: 8 workplace/trauma cases
 2020: 6.77 % or 291 cases: 6 workplace/trauma cases, 2 mediation agreements
 2021: 6.57 % or 288 cases: 0 workplace/trauma cases, 0 mediation agreements
 2022: Previous Provider - 1.03% or 47 cases: 0 workplace/trauma cases, 0 mediation agreements (January 1, 2022 - February 28, 2022)
 2022: Current Provider - 5.18% or 319 cases: 1 Critical Incident Response, 1 Grief Support; 2 Management Consultations (March 2022 - February 28, 2023)
 2023: 1.10% or 68 cases: (March 1, 2023 - May 31, 2023)

Recognizing the need for this program to all groups over and above RFT employees in 2022, Council approved additional funds to provide this service to all employee groups, including part time/temporary staff.

5-Year Budget History

Year	Budget	Actuals	Variance	% Committed
2019	\$95,000	\$100,327	(\$4,646)	105.6%
2020	\$95,000	\$91,564	(\$5,327)	96.4%
2021	\$95,000	\$83,406	\$11,594	87.8%
2022	\$165,000	\$144,174	\$20,826	87.4%
2023	\$165,000	\$153,888*	\$11,112*	93.3%*

* 2023 Year-End Projection

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Health & Safety	Other Prof Services-External	(198,400)				
	Total Expenses	(198,400)	0	0	0	0
Health & Safety	Fees and Recoveries INTERNAL	33,400				
	Total Revenues	33,400	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(165,000)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0108	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Human Resources & Employee Relations	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Employment & Consulting Serv.	Status	Public

Elimination of the Educational Assistance Program

On-going learning through Educational Assistance has benefits for productivity, customer service, employee morale and engagement, attraction and retention of qualified employees all linked to the business strategy of the corporation. As a strategic investment, Educational Assistance helps the Corporation mitigate Attraction and Retention risk, while also assisting with Succession Planning efforts to provide for knowledge transfer and continued customer service.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

While the elimination of the Educational Assistance Budget assists to meet the required target reduction options, the Human Resources Department does not recommend this reduction.

From a business sustainability perspective, the ability to invest in retaining talent - and developing that pool of talent - allows us to keep employees well trained and up-to-date in order to respond to the organization’s change efforts. It also creates a sense of trust and keeps employees engaged and interested since new skills are constantly added to their ‘arsenal’. Apart from saving money, continuous learning is a means for the organization to show its employees they are worth investing in.

Viewed as a solid employee retention tool, tuition assistance helps build employee loyalty and longevity. It also acts as a recruiting tool that benefits the organization with high-potential employees who are focused on growth and learning. Tuition assistance is considered a valuable benefit that many potential employees seek.

Since 2007, through to July 2023, the Cleary International Transfer Agreement has saved the Corporation approximately \$320,000 in tuition fees. The agreement, set to end March 2024, reduces tuition fees for City of Windsor employees by 70%, helping to offset costs through the Educational Assistance budget. Additionally, since July 1, 2017, for those seeking distance education outside of Canada, primarily where programming is not available in surrounding Canadian areas, employees are reimbursed in Canadian funds without the application of exchange rate.

From an employee standpoint, those aspiring to take on roles of greater responsibility are taking charge of their career and professional development to ensure they have the necessary knowledge, skills and competencies required for the job. They recognize the need for skills acquisition and upgrading and look to the organization to support them through the process through educational assistance and tuition reimbursement.

The continuance of the Succession Planning Strategy and effectively the Talent Management Program will see a growing need for Educational Assistance. Employees enrolled in these programs need to upgrade their educational background as outlined in their individual Development Plans.

There are numerous benefits to a well established Educational Assistance Program, including:

1. Given well-defined career paths and developmental opportunities, employees are less likely to leave for another employer, which helps to increase employee retention, improve customer services, reduces recruitment and turnover costs while maintaining a historical knowledge base.

2. Education can also have an impact on the capabilities of an organization. Organizations that have a broadly educated employee base can capitalize on those skills and abilities. Therefore, corporate education cannot only have a profound impact on employee retention & overall productivity, but also on the quality of both individual and corporate deliverables.

3. Educational assistance used as a recruiting tool, helps attract employees who value continuous learning. To prospective employees, educational assistance demonstrates an interest in long-term employee commitment.

4. With a greater emphasis on talent management, there is a spotlight on educational assistance and the contribution towards overall employee development and talent management strategy. There is solid evidence that higher education and skill levels lead to greater productivity, an increased capacity for innovation; organizational success and growth.

While the elimination of the Educational Assistance Budget assists to meet the required target reduction options, the Human Resources Department does not recommend this reduction given our efforts related to Succession Planning, ongoing learning efforts and maintaining best practices. With the growing cost of tuition, the current budget assists the ongoing demands from our employees to utilize this benefit to further their knowledge and hone their skills.

The Educational Assistance Reserve account #1770 has a current balance of \$163,884 which will be used to fund approved requests which are reimbursed upon completion of the courses. If this issue is accepted, the remainder of this reserve account would continue to be used for Educational Assistance until it is depleted.

Performance Indicators

In 2012, a budget cut was offered and subsequently accepted, in the amount of \$20,000, significantly reducing the amount of educational funds available to staff to the current budget of \$56,287. Despite modest surpluses experienced in the educational assistance account, it is anticipated recovery efforts post Covid-19 will warrant additional use of the Educational Assistance & Tuition Reimbursement budget since many educational institutions have turned to virtual online classroom delivery, allowing for greater learner experience, convenience and flexibility.

In general the number of applications received as outlined below by year, continues to generally grow and where staff enrollment in courses have a direct benefit to their job or pose a future potential benefit to the corporation:

- 2009: 152 applications
- 2010: 158 applications
- 2011: 160 applications
- 2012: 168 applications
- 2013: 185 applications
- 2014: 119 applications
- 2015: 95 applications
- 2016: 141 applications
- 2017: 154 applications
- 2018: 128 applications
- 2019: 122 applications
- 2020: 91 applications
- 2021: 81 applications
- 2022: 135 applications
- 2023: 95 applications (as of August 30, 2023)

Risk

On-going learning through educational assistance has benefits for productivity, employee morale and engagement, attraction and retention of qualified employees and is clearly recognized when such development activity is linked to the business strategy of the corporation. Any reduction in relation to eliminating the educational assistance budget will no doubt have a negative impact and underscore our ability to react when faced with a crisis of skill shortage while undermining the intended benefit to both employer and employee.

5-Year Budget History

Year	Budget	Actuals	Variance	% Committed
2019	\$56,287	\$67,177	(\$10,890)*	137.7%
2020	\$56,287	\$46,706	\$9,581*	119.3%
2021	\$56,287	\$50,743	\$5,544*	83.0%
2022	\$56,287	\$38,554*	\$17,733*	68.5%

2023	\$56,287	\$56,287**	0**	100.0%**
------	----------	------------	-----	----------

*The variance amount represents the amount transferred to/(from) the Reserve Account

**2023 Projected Amount

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Employment & Consulting Serv.	Education Allowance	(56,287)				
	Total Expenses	(56,287)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(56,287)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0175	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Human Resources & Employee Relations	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Occupational H&S & Wellness	Status	Public

Establishment of Dedicated Funding for External Investigations

Each year the Corporation conducts investigations into incidents of workplace harassment and violence arising in our workplaces in order to comply with legislative obligations and to provide an effective process for addressing these matters. These investigations are typically conducted by in-house staff who receive specialized training to perform this essential task, however Transit’s collective agreement mandates that allegations of harassment and violence be investigated by a third party. At this time, there are no dedicated funds to cover the cost of these external investigations. Given the frequency with which circumstances arise that mandate the use of an external investigator; our recommendation is to establish dedicated ongoing funding for these investigations.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Each year the Corporation conducts investigations into incidents and complaints of workplace harassment and violence arising in our workplaces in order to comply with legislative obligations and to provide an effective process for addressing these workplace health and safety matters. Over the past five years, the Corporation has addressed an average of 46 reported incidents per year. When looking at the best approach to address an incident or allegation of workplace harassment, and after initial interviews are completed, the opportunity exists to address some of these circumstances through an informal or mediated approach to dispute resolution. However, in some circumstances, one of the parties may be unwilling to participate in an informal resolution. In these circumstances, Administration must determine if the circumstance warrants investigation. Investigations follow a formalized process detailed in the Workplace Harassment and Violence procedures the result of which is for the investigator to determine whether the allegations brought forward meet the definition of harassment and/or violence is determined through the investigation process. In addition to making a determination of whether or not a violation has occurred, the Investigation Report will include recommendations designed to prevent a future occurrence of the same type of behaviours. In instances where a threat of violence has occurred, an informal approach is not suitable given the established risk level. In these instances, the workplace investigation will assess if the allegations brought forward are confirmed, and, provide reasonable recommendations designed to ensure the safety of all workplace parties.

For the most part, in-house staff who receive specialized training to perform this essential task conducted the investigations. Instances where contracting an external investigator include where the parties are members of Senior Administration, such as commissioners and executive directors, members of City Council, divisional reviews or where there is evidence of the presence of potential systemic issues. Further, there are specific provisions in the Transit Windsor Collective Agreement that mandate that investigations into workplace violence and harassment complaints be done by an external third party. In the past five years, 28 incidents and/or complaints were investigated through a contract to external legal firms at a cost of \$114,262 or approximately \$4,081 per investigation. In 2023, Council provided one-time funding of \$30,000 to cover the costs of external investigations. Given the regularity with which circumstances arise that mandate the use of an external investigator based on the five-year overview, it is paramount to establish an annual budget for these expenses to ensure thorough reviews are performed. At this time, the cost of mediation services will remain with the affected department.

Risk

Failure to ensure proper, timely investigations are conducted opens the Corporation to the potential for fines and penalties issued under the Canada Labour Code and the Occupational Health and Safety Act as well as civil suits. Where appropriate and/or required, having dedicated funds in the operating budget will enable Administration to respond promptly.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Health & Safety	Other Prof Services-External	30,000				
	Total Expenses	30,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	30,000	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0177	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Human Resources & Employee Relations	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Employment & Consulting Serv.	Status	Public

Establishment of Dedicated Funding for Cognitive Demands Analysis

A Cognitive Demands Analysis (CDA) is an objective evaluation of the specific cognitive, emotional and psychological skills required to perform the essential job duties of a given position. A proactive approach to capturing the cognitive and behavioral demands can assist with providing suitable accommodations and implementing strategies that aim to reduce claims and costs associated with mental health conditions. The Corporation has used CDA's in a number of return-to-work plans for employees throughout the year with success, however, there is no dedicated funding for these analysis and departments need to allocate funding from alternate accounts. This funding is being requested in order to perform an analysis on the positions where it is deemed critical.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Issue Detail The majority of positions in the Corporation have a Physical Demands Analysis (PDA) completed and the City recently completed a Request for Quote to secure the services of Achieva Health Inc. to complete PDA's for newly created positions and changed positions. Further, positions are reviewed every 5 years to determine if a new PDA is required.

A PDA is a systematic procedure to quantify and evaluate all of the physical and environmental demand components of all essential and nonessential tasks of a job. PDA's are an essential component of the return to work and modified work process and assist both the City and the treating practitioner to determine an employees' suitability and functional capabilities. It is also used as a proactive injury management tool to establish physical testing for a specific job based on the essential functions of that job.

There is an option for the Human Resources Department to expand the PDA's and begin to have cognitive job demands analysis (CDA's) completed for all positions. It has been identified that occupational claims related to mental health are on the rise and 28% of our Corporate current long-term disability cases are related to mental health. A CDA is an objective evaluation of the specific cognitive, emotional and psychological skills required to perform the essential job duties of a given position. As mentioned, traditional PDA's typically address only the physical components of the essential job duties. Jobs are multifaceted and performance at work depends on the interplay of human physical, cognitive, emotional, behavioural and environmental factors. Having a CDA in conjunction with a PDA can be a helpful baseline measurement tool to complete a number of functions in a variety of Human Resources positions.

The Disability Management Specialists, Ergonomist and Wellness Specialist and Occupational Health and Safety Advisors can utilize the information to assist with completing job hazard analysis, returning employees to a safe work environment and accommodating employees in their respective jobs; Employee Relations and the Total Compensation Specialists could reference the information during a job evaluation review; and Business Partners would benefit from referencing the information during the recruitment process.

Achieva Health Inc. has the ability to conduct CDA's as well as PDA's. Achieva has quoted \$900 to conduct a comprehensive CDA, which includes both a cognitive demands analysis as well as a cognitive tasks analysis, completed in 15 hours. Positions will be prioritized to ensure the CDA's are completed first for jobs where mental health claims are more predominant, such as Social Services, Huron Lodge and Transit Windsor. There are 100 jobs to be assessed in these three departments.

Performance Indicators

A proactive approach to capturing the cognitive and behavioural demands can assist with understanding the demands at each position to better respond to accommodation and return to work challenges when they arise; and help with implementing appropriate strategies aimed to reduce incidents associated with mental health conditions. In 2023, Human Resources was provided with \$30,000 in one-time funding to conduct CDA's and prioritized 32 jobs for assessment. Some of the positions identified to have a CDA in 2023 are: Bus Operator, Registered Nurse, Fire Fighter, Chief Wastewater Treatment Operator, Waste Collection Operator, Parks Operator, Team Leader Customer Service. Once CDA's for all 32 identified positions are completed, the full \$30,000.00 will have been utilized. This request is to establish stable funding in the operating budget of \$117,000 annually in order to conduct CDA's annually with the goal of having a CDA for each of our 646 active jobs within a 5-year timeframe. Having CDA's available increases our ability to comply with the Psychological Demands factor of the CSA Standard for Psychological health and safety in the workplace.

Risk

Determination of the cognitive and behavioural demands of work are an important part of holistic workplace intervention, especially important when developing return-to-work plans for employees with reduced cognitive or behavioural capacity. Each CDA will undergo regular review to ensure updates are made as job demands change. These comprehensive and detailed assessments can be utilized when any health condition (cognitive, physical or emotional) impact an employee's thinking, cognition and/or their interpersonal processes and abilities. A CDA can assist with clearly defining and standardizing the interpretation of workplace demands into the health field (and vice versa). Facilitating successful return to work plans and providing suitable accommodations can be challenging when cognitive work demands are not clearly defined.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Employment & Consulting Serv.	Other Prof Services-External	117,000				
	Total Expenses	117,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	117,000	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0026	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	POA, Purchasing, Risk Management	Category	[H] Line Item Reduction
Division	Risk & Insurance	Status	Public

Reduction in Legal Claims Budget

A reduction to the legal claims budget of \$444,500 is being brought forward to meet Council’s 5% target reduction per department.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

A reduction to the legal claims budget would result in a further depletion of the self-insurance reserve fund. As claim payments, settlements, or judgments become due, the City has no option but to pay them. If the claims budget and self-insurance reserve (SIR) fund have insufficient funds to pay for the claims, an alternative funding source is required. A reduction in the claims budget would not reduce the claims expense and would not result in actual savings to the Corporation.

An actuarial review on the SIR Fund was conducted in 2017. According to the report, the City’s actuarial deficit as of December 31, 2016 was \$6.1M. The draft report recommended that the City increase the Self-Insurance Reserve (SIR) by this amount. However, this was not done due to competing budget priorities. The SIR fund currently has a balance of \$7.9M as at July 31, 2023, which, based on the actuarial review, remains in an actuarial deficit position.

The report also recommended that the City increase the annual claims budget to \$4.36M for 2018 in order to not fall further into deficit. Budget Issue 2018-0354 was brought forward to increase the annual claims budget to \$4.36M for 2018. An increase of \$658,000 was approved to bring the annual claims budget to \$3.02M. While no increases were made to the SIR, any surplus in the annual claims budget would fund the SIR, and the SIR would be used to fund any deficits to the claims budget in a given year.

The claims budget was subsequently reduced to \$3M for a position conversion in #2019-0462 per CAO Report #4841. During the 2020 budget process, City Council decided to fully reduce the transfer to the SIR Fund by \$399,057. The claims budget was further reduced by \$200,000 in the 2021 budget on 2021-0085 and an additional \$200,000 in the 2023 Budget on 2023-0208. Transferring surplus funds from the claims budget is the only current funding source for the SIR. By further reducing the claims cost budget, Risk Management will not have sufficient budgeted funds to pay its claims and will need to start depleting the SIR fund without a source to replenish it. Once the SIR fund is depleted, an alternate funding source will then need to fund claim costs as they become due. When a settlement or judgment becomes due, there is no viable option but to pay for it.

Claims costs fluctuate, but long-term trends suggest that the City’s claims costs will rise in the coming years. It is impossible to predict with certainty the number or severity of claims that may be made against the City, or the magnitude or timing of any eventual settlement.

Risk

A reduction to the Claims budget may result in the Claims budget being exceeded in 2024 and no surplus to replenish the reserve.

Claim Costs 5 Year History (2019-2023 Projected)

Year	Budget	Actual	Variance
------	--------	--------	----------

2019	\$3,001,647	\$1,876,943	\$1,124,704
2020	\$3,000,647	\$3,039,054	\$(38,407)
2021	\$2,800,647	\$2,855,516	\$(54,869)
2022	\$2,920,647	\$2,874,933	\$45,714
2023*	\$2,712,505	\$2,740,000*	\$(27,495)

*2023 is projected

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Risk & Insurance	Claim Costs and Subrogation	(444,500)				
	Total Expenses	(444,500)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(444,500)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0021	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Economic Development	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Economic Development & Climate Change	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Economic Development Office	Status	Public

Reduction to the Economic Development Base Budget

In order for the department to meet the 5% budget reduction target, although not recommended, this budget issue is presenting a \$160,841 reduction to the \$950,000 budget approved through CR473/2021 to create the base budget for the newly established Economic Development Office.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

The initial proposal for the Economic Development Office projected a staff complement of fourteen positions, at an approximate cost of \$1.6 million. The Commissioner of Economic Development and Innovation was approved for annual funding of \$950,000 and authorized to allocate the funds for annual departmental expenses, and to recruit the priority positions required to continue progress on Windsor Works and support the economic development investments and growth for the City of Windsor. The Commissioner continues to recruit priority positions across her portfolio. Economic Development staff within the Corporation advocate specifically for City of Windsor interests and are tasked with implementing the Council approved Windsor Works strategies. City economic development staff are the main point of contact within the Corporation for InvestWE and external customers, and also offer business attraction, retention and expansion support.

Invest Windsor Essex (InvestWE) provides business retention & expansion support, a small business & entrepreneurship centre, attends trade missions, and solicits foreign direct investment. While valued services, InvestWE represents the entire Windsor Essex region. The City's economic development office is responsible to City Council and is focused on championing and protecting the interests of the City of Windsor.

The catalyst March 2022 announcement of the NextStar Energy investment required an immediate shift in priorities to meet the commitments made by the City, and realize the potential additional benefits by securing NextStar supply chain companies. This announcement also changed the approach to future growth planning, requiring a focus on optimizing the available land at the airport and aggressively pursuing additional land opportunities.

The current annual funding allocation is insufficient to support the staffing complement originally proposed, and new initiatives have required a reconsideration of priority staff positions. A decrease of \$160,841.00 to the base budget represents the majority of costs associated with a regular full-time position and further constrains the department's staffing capacity, which in turn constrains the ability to action priority activities such as:

- Next Star Energy project management
- Supply chain inquiries - Although several economic development opportunities have presented as a result of the initial NextStar Energy investment, the project management and coordination across multiple city departments has been lead by the economic development office as a single point of contact, ensuring a coordinated, seamless approach and exceptional customer service. While difficult to quantify as each situation is unique, City Council has recently approved packages for four suppliers, which at fruition, represent nearly \$1B in investment, 1000 jobs, and \$25M in lease revenue. These relationships must be prudently managed to ensure a superior level of customer service.
- Land Development initiatives - Sufficient staff are required to respond to NextStar supply chain inquiries and address other investment opportunities. The availability of larger parcels of appropriate employment land is limited and staff are required to action any Council direction to develop an additional future supply.

- Energy File - Strong economic development and electrification of transportation are significantly affecting Ontario's electricity system, driving up demand and increasing regional needs. The Independent Electricity System Operator (IESO) is seeking to increase supply and the Ontario government is pursuing new electricity transmission infrastructure projects in southwestern Ontario. IESO acknowledges the role of municipalities in the procurement and development of new generation projects, and encourages the development of local solutions. Dedicated staff are required to research and analyze solutions, pursue municipal support and ensure appropriate community engagement.
- Grant Opportunities - Applications for grant opportunities are often very prescriptive and require significant cross-departmental engagement and Council approval. The range of funding varies (as examples \$1.7M allocated through SDAF and Council's approval to pursue the Housing Accelerator Fund estimated at \$40M), but regardless of amount, staff must be assigned to ensure oversight and adherence to grant criteria.
- Data/KPI collection and reporting - Statistics and data are being requested and required by internal and external customers, upper levels of government and are increasingly tied to legislation and funding opportunities. It is critical that fulsome and accurate data/statistics/key performance indicators are collected, analyzed and reported.
- Customer response and relationship development (historic levels of Economic Development inquiries)
- Local business community supports
- Windsor Works strategy and Implementation Plan initiatives

Past research into the structure of other municipalities determined that Hamilton had 45 staff tasked with economic development related initiatives, while Kitchener had 30. Several neighbouring county municipalities employ dedicated economic development staff, while others embed this work within other departments.

Risk

The economic landscape of the city has changed dramatically since Windsor Works was approved, with catalyst investments being made by NextStar Energy and the planned acute care hospital in the city, and the VW EV plant in St. Thomas. Existing staff resources have been diverted to support these investments and related supply chain inquiries. Current staff are challenged to respond to these competing priorities, which present a risk to the City's reputation as an attractive location for investment, and a significant loss of revenue should these investment opportunities be lost to other jurisdictions. As noted above, in the past few months since NextStar was announced, four companies have selected Windsor as their preferred located, with the anticipated investments totalling nearly \$1Billion and generating nearly 1000 direct jobs. Although these opportunities presented as a result of the initial NextStar Energy investment, the project management and coordination across multiple city departments was lead by the economic development office as a single point of contact, ensuring a coordinated, seamless approach and exceptional customer service. There is a risk that if this funding reduction is accepted, it will impede the ability to develop and manage these business relationships, hire the positions required to address customer inquiries, grant responsibilities and other Council directed priorities; support land development planning; and advance Windsor Works recommendations.

It is critical to ensure that the department has the appropriate resources to respond to opportunities and serve the needs of the community, particularly in the areas of energy and land development planning, customer fulfillment, and project management.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Economic Developmt. Office	Other Pay	(160,841)				
	Total Expenses	(160,841)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(160,841)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0020	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Economic Development	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Economic Development & Climate Change	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Economic Development Office	Status	Public

Permanent Funding for the Climate Change Reserve Fund

The Climate Change Reserve Fund of \$150,000, established in the response to the Climate Change Emergency Declaration (2020), has been exhausted. This Fund has been used to support grant applications for two projects outlined within Acceleration of Climate Change Actions in response to the Climate Change Emergency Declaration. Re-establishment of this reserve fund will allow Administration to leverage these dollars through grants and/or partnership opportunities for climate change initiatives.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: \$200,000 (BSR) - If this funding for the Climate Change Reserve Fund is not permanently approved, Administration requests that a one-time transfer be approved to allow initiatives to continue for 2024.

Issue Detail

In 2020, City Council approved the creation of a Climate Change Reserve Fund. This fund was originally funded through one-time funding from the Budget Stabilization Reserve Fund. The Fund was established to ensure that Administration could act quickly in seeking grants and implementing priority initiatives. To date, this fund was successful in supporting applications to FCM's Community Efficiency Fund and Green Municipal Fund supporting the Deep Energy Efficiency Retrofit Program and the Sustainable Neighbourhood Action Plan - Sandwich South, respectively. In addition, many Federal climate change funding dollars are distributed to third parties (e.g. ICLEI Canada) to undertake collaborative pilot projects with municipalities. These third parties generally have short deadlines for application and require some municipal financial commitments. The City of Windsor has been successful in participating in collaborative projects with ICLEI Canada, namely the update to the City's Climate Change Adaptation Plan and their Implementation through Collaboration pilot project. To date, the funds for these projects have been managed through the Environmental Master Plan operating budget as a result of surpluses due to staff gapping.

The fund could also support immediate needs by the Corporation to better understand climate change implications that require additional professional or technological supports. For example, Infrastructure Canada requires climate lens assessments to be completed and submitted along with grant applications. If projects are successful, the cost of these assessments are eligible for repayment. Infrastructure Canada has indicated that these assessments will become a more significant part of the application process and project selection. Due to internal resourcing constraints or complexity of the projects, Consultants are usually retained to complete parts of assessment. To date, Administration has pulled together the funds to cover these expenses within operating budgets, which may impact the department's initiatives for that year, as most awards and recovery of the assessment costs will occur the next year. The Climate Change Reserve Fund could support these assessments and upon successful application, eligible costs can be returned to the Fund.

Administration is seeking to re-establish this fund via a dedicated, annual transfer to reserve to further support additional grant opportunities and pilot projects to take advantage of federal and provincial objectives that align with the City's Climate Change Master Plans, as well as support departments that require climate lens assessments as part of federal grant submissions.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Enviro.Sustainblt y&Climate Chg	TRANSFER to Reserve Fund	200,000				
	Total Expenses	200,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	200,000	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0060	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Economic Development	Classification	[1] Budget Increase
Department	Transit Windsor	Category	[G] Line Item Increase
Division	Transit Maintenance	Status	Public

Creation of Fleet Reserve for Transit Fleet

With a revenue fleet of 119 buses with a replacement value of over \$163M, as well as continued service expansion, Transit Windsor requires dedicated funds for its ongoing Fleet replacement needs. This request will create a new Fleet Reserve and transfer operating dollars annually to fund future Transit Fleet replacement requirements.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

This is a request for a new Reserve to be created to replace rolling stock at the end of its useful life.

The design life of a standard heavy-duty transit bus is 12 years. The department needs to purchase a minimum of 10 new buses per year (based on current fleet size) to maintain the industry-standard replacement timeframe of 12 years. Transit Windsor is proposing to build the reserve to fund these buses at the end of the life cycle. Through future budget submissions, Transit will look to develop a model that will provide sustainable funding for the replacement of all its Fleet needs.

The establishment of a dedicated Reserve to fund the nearly \$163M in Transit Fleet assets supports service sustainability and prudent financial planning. The department will review the life cycle of the Fleet and bring forward budget issues as required in the future.

Based on the purchase of 10 new buses per year (assumed to be diesel-electric hybrid buses) with a 12 year life cycle, at an approximate cost of \$1.36M per hybrid bus, the initial budget request to create this reserve is \$1.14M (\$1,368,900 x 10 buses / 12 years = \$1,140,900)

It is not known at this time whether there will be further grant funding provided by either the Federal or Provincial government in the coming years. It is important to begin to build a reserve for the Transit fleet, as is the practice throughout other City of Windsor departments. Should grants become available, adjustments will be made to future budgets as required.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fleet Maintenance	TRANSFER to Reserve Fund	1,140,900				
	Total Expenses	1,140,900	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	1,140,900	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0085	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Economic Development	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Transit Windsor	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Transit Operations	Status	Public

Reduce Transit Service to Achieve 5% Budget Reduction

To provide council with the required 5% budget reduction, Transit has put forward a service reduction of approximately 60,530 hours. Although not recommended by administration, if approved by council, Transit would review routes and determine which reductions would have minimal impact in providing necessary service to the public. This reduction is scalable to the required amount of expense reduction. This issue outlines a financial reduction value however, the accounts impacted could vary. A report would be brought forward with refined budget impacts once reductions were determined. A report would be brought forward with refined budget impacts once reductions were determined. It should be noted that a 5% budget reduction would translate to a 20% service reduction.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: \$3,500,000 Budget Stabilization Reserve funding for a September 2024 implementation

Issue Detail

Transit Windsor currently provides service seven (7) days per week. The routes, which operate in Windsor and Essex County range from corridor to neighbourhood-oriented with various service frequencies, and are based on service demand and available resources. Not all routes run on all days, nor do they run at all times of the day.

In order to reduce operating costs, Transit would be able to reduce or eliminate certain routes, as well as reduce the frequency of some routes. The overall total cost per service hour for Transit per the Canadian Urban Transit Association (CUTA) statistics, reported annually, based on the most recent available statistics for 2022 is \$130.

On average, Transit earns revenue to fund approximately 50% of service. Since Transit would be reducing service on a “last-in, first-out” basis, the first routes to be eliminated would include the 518X, 418X, frequency reductions on Routes 1C and 2, and other recent service improvements.

In order to provide council with the required target reduction, Transit has put forward a service reduction of approximately 60,530 hours. The reduction is scalable and therefore can be adjusted based on operating budget reduction needs.

If approved by Council, Transit would review all routes and service frequencies and determine which routes would have the least impact on service for riders if reduced or eliminated, while at the same time meeting the cost reduction requirements. This issue outlines a financial reduction value however, the accounts impacted could vary. A report would be brought to council with true budget impacts once route reductions were determined. A budget adjustment would be completed to properly impact the appropriate operating budget accounts.

It is important to note that this reduction in transit service is counter-productive to the Transit Master Plan growth initiatives currently underway. Although this issue would achieve the required 5% budget reduction, it would translate to a 20% reduction to Transit Windsor service, seriously impacting Transit Windsor’s ability to service its users, and may place other revenue sources (e.g., tuition-based pass programs) in jeopardy due to service reductions.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fleet Maintenance	Motor Fuels	4,912,020				
Fleet Maintenance	Vehicle Maint Parts/Materials	(2,754,083)				
	Total Expenses	2,157,937	0	0	0	0
TW - Operations	Transit Revenue	2,622,936				
	Total Revenues	2,622,936	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	4,780,873	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0056	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Economic Development	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Transit Windsor	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Transit Operations	Status	Public

2024 Transit Windsor Service Plan

The Transit Windsor Master Plan identified significant changes in the transit network in order to streamline routes, reduce travel time and increase efficiency. The Transit Windsor Master Plan was brought to council on January 27, 2020. This plan was approved with Council Report CR40/2020 and acts as the guiding document for the improvement of transit services in Windsor and Essex County. The changes outlined below, represent a measured, fiscally responsible approach to targeted improvements where the need is the greatest, and derive the best value from existing resources.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Transit Windsor has seen ridership recovery to well over 100% of pre-pandemic levels, often running as high as 121% of average levels, pre-2020, placing severe strain on the system, and resulting in overloaded buses and missed passengers. The 2024 Service Plan continues the service improvements as outlined in the Transit Windsor Master Plan, addresses overcrowding issues, and remains firmly focused on fiscal responsibility in doing so. The changes outlined below achieve the majority of the Year 4 & 6 goals under the Transit Master Plan, while utilizing fleet and human resources as effectively and efficiently as possible.

Of the nearly 26,000 hours of planned changes, 35% of the hours are reallocations of existing resources to ensure service is deployed most effectively, focusing on areas of highest demand. Additional hours focus primarily on route and frequency improvements during base service periods, which allows for the Service Plan to be implemented with little impact to the current fleet size, thus reducing capital expenditures. The additional service hours represent an approximate increase of 6% over 2023 service hours.

The 2024 Service Plan identifies the following as priorities:

- Redistribution of service hours from the current school extra routes to improve service in South Windsor, including Southwood Lakes and Devonshire Heights.
- In response to ridership increases, improvement of frequencies on north-south corridor routes
- Implementation of new or enhanced local routes which will provide improved service in residential neighbourhoods
- In response to rider demand, improvement in Saturday and Sunday services, with virtually all routes now operating weekend schedules
- Extension of express service from St. Clair College to the West End (HDGH) terminal, improving travel times and improving connections with other routes

The changes are aligned with industry principles and best practices with respect to transit service delivery:

- Primary routes should provide rapid, high-frequency service connecting main terminals
- Neighbourhood feeder routes connecting lower-density areas to main nodes (transfer points)
- Route frequencies should be of no less than 30 minutes, ensuring service quality and reliability
- Avoidance of one-way service whenever possible, with a preference for two-way service on all routes

The annual gross operating costs (including salaries plus fringes and other operating costs) related to this service plan are projected at \$1,330,300. This includes the costs to hire 9 bus operators. After factoring in the projected revenue increase due to ridership of 50%, the net annual costs are projected at \$665,150. The department is recommending a budget levy increase of \$665,150.

The recommended changes represent a total of 16,908 additional annual service hours. This budget issue also requires purchase of two diesel-electric hybrid buses (TRN# 001-24) estimated at \$2.7M and new bus stops signs estimated at \$60,000 (TRN#001-2024). The additional fleet needs are a result of the accommodation of the last three years' service plans (2021-2023) within the existing fleet complement. Routes 518X, 605, revised Central 3, and 418X were all new service additions, and require a combined 6 buses. With the introduction of these routes, as well as the re-introduction of Special Events service to Detroit, the department is now feeling the strain of stretching these assets to their limits, and therefore two additional buses are required to maintain approved levels of service. These requests are included in the 2024 Capital Budget Plan. Without the approval of these capital dollars, the implementation of Master Plan will be very challenging.

Capital Budget Implication

The changes represent a total of 16,908 additional annual service hours. Should this budget issue be approved, it will also require the purchase of two diesel-electric hybrid buses estimated at \$2.7M and new bus stops signs estimated at \$60,000. These requests are not included in the 2024 Capital Budget Plan. Without the approval of these capital dollars, the implementation of Master Plan will be very challenging.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	201,198				
Corporate Services	Computer Supplies	3,000				
Corporate Services	Office Supplies	2,000				
Facility Maintenance	Maintenance Parts & Materials	10,000				
Fleet Maintenance	Licenses	2,200				
Fleet Maintenance	Motor Fuels	290,000				
Fleet Maintenance	Oils and Lubricants	14,700				
Fleet Maintenance	Other Prof Services-External	15,000				
Fleet Maintenance	Vehicle Maint Parts/Materials	130,500				
TW - Operations	Clothing - Uniforms	5,000				
TW - Operations	Hourly-Reg.Full Time	609,705				
TW - Operations	Operating and Other Supplies	3,000				
TW - Operations	Vehicle Insurance	17,000				
TW - Planning	Contracted Services	15,000				
TW-Sales & Customer Service	Program Supplies	12,000				
	Total Expenses	1,330,303	0	0	0	0
TW - Operations	Transit Revenue	(665,150)				
	Total Revenues	(665,150)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	665,153	0	0	0	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Transit Windsor	TW - Operations	Operator	Regular Full-Time	9.0
Total:				9.0

Budget Issue #	2024-0014	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Fire & Rescue	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Fire Support Services	Status	Public

Addition of One Fire & Rescue Clerk

A new clerical position would enable Windsor Fire & Rescue Services redistribute clerical tasks amongst employees and eliminate the backlog of unfinished work. Over time, increasing administrative tasks resulting from an enhanced Records Management System, Payroll System, new City initiatives and increased emergency management responsibilities and service demands it is no longer possible to provide the appropriate level of administrative support with the existing clerical pool.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

Over the last several years WFRS has seen an increase in call volume, changes in legislation and standards that result in increased administrative and clerical support demands. New reporting requirements, new City projects and initiatives in which the department is involved in create additional work for the administrative staff. In addition, as the clerical workforce gains more seniority vacation time increases. Simply put, all these factors mean the same number of clerical staff that has existed for decades is being asked to perform significantly more work than ever before. The toll of this increased workload is evident; morale and the mental health of our staff have been negatively affected.

Additionally, increased administrative duties resulting from provincial legislation changes, the increased training and equipment requirements of provincially deployable specialty teams, and the move towards more complete records management has resulted in a shortage of labour, which in turn has caused most Clerks to become months behind on their lower-priority tasks. This has affected our ability to verify our data entry for various critical systems and reduced our ability to follow through with revenue-generating activities resulting from our emergency responses and inspections.

Most importantly, Fire's clerical staff have been left going from one urgent issue to the next, meaning that there is never the opportunity for personnel to reflect on their existing process and develop better solutions. The additional Clerk, once fully trained, will take on specific tasks from several existing Clerks, allowing for the redistribution of tasks amongst all clerks to meet the existing administrative obligations to the Corporation and our external stakeholders.

The total cost associated with adding one position is detailed below:

	Annual Cost
Salary incl. Fringes	\$90,620
Clothing	\$400
Computer (Desktop)	\$1,000
Total Cost	\$92,020

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	22,487				
FIRE -Admin	Clothing - Uniforms	400				

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
FIRE -Admin	PC & Maint. Allocation	1,000				
FIRE -Admin	Salary-Reg.Full Time	68,133				
	Total Expenses	92,020	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	92,020	0	0	0	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Fire & Rescue	FIRE -Admin	Fire & Rescue Clerk	Regular Full-Time	1.0
			Total:	1.0

2024 Budget Issue Detail



Budget Issue #	2024-0224	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Library Services	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Administration - Library	Status	Public

Branch Closure

As WPL's budget is primarily composed of staffing costs (70%), facilities costs (9%) and collection costs (12%), a budget reduction can only be achieved through a reduction in public service. The closing of a Library Branch would satisfy this budget reduction, however, this option is not recommended, as it would have significant impact on customer service. If this option was recommended and approved, WPL would complete a review and analysis to determine which Library Branch would be appropriate for closure to meet the required budget reduction and a report would be brought forward with the recommendations.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: an upset limit of \$500,000 from BSR requested if a decision is made to close a branch

Issue Detail

Although Administration does not recommend the closure of any branch, the option is brought forward in adherence to City Council's direction to provide options to achieve a 5% budget reduction. It should be noted that the budget reduction for the closure of a branch would mainly result in staffing and branch specific budget item reductions in isolation, and the overhead and back-of-house support levels would not likely vary substantially based on the closure of a single branch.

If this option is recommended and approved, WPL will then complete a review and analysis to determine which Library Branch would be appropriate for closure to meet the required budget reduction and a report would be brought forward with the recommendations.

Should Council wish to pursue this option, one-time funding with an upset limit of \$500,000 is requested to fund branch operations until such time as the closures can be effected as well as costs associated with the closure, including however not limited to, moving of branch furniture, equipment and materials to alternate branches or locations.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Administration - Library (F30)	Expenditure Clearing	(372,280)				
	Total Expenses	(372,280)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(372,280)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0202	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[1] Budget Increase
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[G] Line Item Increase
Division	Facilities Operations	Status	Public

Facilities Maintenance Budget for Parks Amenities, Gates and Fences

This budget issue is to increase the annual maintenance budget in order to address repair and maintenance costs in the expanding Facilities portfolio as more parklands and park amenities are added over the years. This funding will prevent budgetary gaps within Facilities while continuing to provide adequate maintenance to park amenities. This funding would establish an operating budget for Facilities to install new gates and fences to safeguard the inventory and equipment located at City properties. Currently there is a lack of security measures in place to protect and guard the City assets stored in the yards against vandalism or theft. The budget funding will be used to maintain gates and fences going forward to ensure that they remain in good condition and provide the level of security.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

Over the years, the City has added various new parkland to its portfolio, as well as installed new parks amenities, such as splash pads, park lighting, washrooms, picnic tables and benches, to existing parks. As the number of these parkland and parks amenities grow, the ability for Facilities to properly maintain these assets in its portfolio within current operating budget dollars is diminishing.

There are over 1,800 benches and picnic tables, 1,700 park lighting, 43 park washrooms, and 14 splash pads that the Facilities department regularly maintains. Recent capital projects that added new amenities and parklands that impact Facilities annual maintenance operating budget are listed below:

- * Splash pad at Fontainebleau Park (2022)
- * Gateway Park (2022)
- * Additional lighting for the riverfront parks from the Ambassador Bridge to Randolph Ave (2022)
- * Splash pad at Wilson Park (2022)
- * New dog parks at Oakwood Park and Elizabeth Kishkon Park (2023)
- * Washroom facility at Elizabeth Kishkon Park (2023)
- * Little River Corridor Washroom (2023)

As part of normal course of operations, a high volume of materials and equipment are stored at various maintenance yards so they can be accessed quickly to meet repair and/or maintenance needs. There is also an inventory of raw materials as well as assembled benches, picnic tables, play structures, fleet vehicles, operating equipment and project materials kept at the yards. There have been instances of unauthorized individuals who entered City properties and illegally retrieved materials from the yards.

In addition to the maintenance yard storage, there are various City properties that have outdoor equipment that is visible to the general public and exposed to risks of vandalism and theft. As an example, the recent event of vandalism incident reported where air conditioning units were damaged, could have been prevented had there been secured fencing protecting the HVAC equipment.

Secured fencing and gates to the City yards and facilities strengthen the physical control of the City assets. Facilities is requesting annual operating budget to maintain fences and gates across the City properties in the effort to discourage vandalism and theft.

Risk

Should this budget issue not be approved by Council, the City may increase its exposure to the Infrastructure enterprise risk. The shortfall in the maintenance budget will have a negative impact on the level of service provided to the public for maintaining and repairing Facilities and Parks amenities, and increase of 311 complaints regarding the state of these facilities. In addition, the City may increase its exposure to the Infrastructure enterprise risk. This could have an impact on the level of confidence in keeping the City properties and assets securely stored. Without this funding, there maybe rising incidents of vandalism and theft of City properties that could led to in higher maintenance and replacement costs.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fac.Ops. -Parks & Rec	Contracted Services	50,000				
	Total Expenses	50,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	50,000	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0134	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Parks	Status	Public

Eliminate or Reduction of Students and Community Living Staff in Parks

Reduction of Students and Community Living staff that provide core functions during high activities periods in parks, citywide beautification and on sports fields. This issue will have a significant impact to the level of service provided during the peak summer months. The horticulture staff are an integral part of the beautification of parkland in the city. The operations services include trimming of grass and weeds around various infrastructure, litter pick-up and washroom cleaning among numerous other tasks that the full time staff cannot maintain during the busy summer months. Reductions in the staffing levels will impact the appearance of parkland to the public and may yield additional 311 calls. This reduction is scalable from 0% to 100% with corresponding service level reductions.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

Students and Community Living employees provide several primary core parks functions. These resources are available at a time when the demands on the Parks Departments are the greatest, as weather and actual physical park areas are significant factors in Parks ability to get recreational areas, sports fields and gardens ready for use in a timely manner. They compliment regular full time staff and provide coverage for weekend, afternoons and holiday coverage at a reasonable cost. Several Parks programs, particularly in the Horticultural division are exclusively undertaken with student labour. They include maintaining the BIA planters, hanging baskets, bridge planters, hard surface weed control, garden bed maintenance, and tree nursery maintenance.

Additionally, in the Fall of 2015 the Parks Department, with support from Local 82, engaged in a Community Living Employment Placement program where Community Living Individuals started working in parks, horticulture, forestry and at Ojibway. These employees are paid at labourer rates, funded from the Student and Community Living wage budget. If this recommendation is supported, Parks would no longer be able to participate in the Community Living program.

The total operating budget for Summer Students and Community Living employees in Parks is \$1,358,793 (including fringes). The elimination of all of the Student and Community Living positions would yield significant levels of savings. The number of weeks that Students work could be reduced to mitigate the impact on the level of service throughout the Parks, however this would likely be offset by increased overtime from existing full-time staff assuming the current level of service is maintained. In addition, any reduction or elimination of Student and Community Living temporary staffing would impair the ability of Parks to provide services to outdoor recreation events and sports field preparations.

The elimination of the Student and Community Living budget for Parks would impact sports facilities that would experience a tremendous reduction in service and maintenance, which will have a major impact on the citizens and sport user groups. With any elimination of Students and Community Living staff, the Parks Full-time staff will be allocated to Regional or Premier Parks. Tournament play would be discouraged, which will have a revenue impact to Recreation as well as the local economy.

As Students are responsible for maintenance programs such as the hanging baskets, bridge planters and BIA planters, these programs would need to be outsourced at greater costs should they be continued.

For the Forestry division, two projects would be impacted if Students are eliminated in 2024 having a negative cumulative effect on our operations/programs as follows:

- 1) Tree Nursery

The care of the young trees within the Tree Nursery will remain vulnerable to the adverse environmental conditions and lack of maintenance that impact the outcome of growing healthy, vibrant trees and remain on their harvesting schedule

2) Mulching Program of Young Park Trees

The mulching of young recently planted trees, protects the trees from drought, and damages inadvertently done to the stems of trees during maintenance activities. The mulching of trees also improves the aesthetics of the parkland.

Risk

The elimination of Students and Community Living, and the services they are able to provide while working each year would increase the Corporations' exposure to both the Portrayal and Attraction & Retention enterprise risks, identified as priorities for 2019-2020. Students play a large role in maintaining the City's civic image through the quality of the City's parks experience, and the program provides an important opportunity for students to experience working for the City of Windsor, which will hopefully increase their interest in considering the City of Windsor as a potential employer once finished school.

Reduction of Students and Community Living Staff in Parks (Wages Not Including Fringe)

Parks Division	Annual Budget	20% Reduction	35% Reduction	50% Reduction
Parks Operating	\$780,506	\$156,101	\$273,177	\$390,253
Horticulture	\$303,654	\$60,731	\$106,279	\$151,827
Forestry	\$58,830	\$11,766	\$20,591	\$29,415
Ojibway and Natural Areas	\$70,218	\$14,044	\$24,576	\$35,109
TOTAL	\$1,213,208	\$242,642	\$424,623	\$606,604

The level of reduction in the above chart would impact each specific division that employs temporary staff. For Parks Operations a 20% reduction would impact the weed and grass cutting schedules at neighborhood and community parks. Any additional reductions would significantly impact the level of service at premier parkland including the riverfront. In the Horticulture division the 20% reduction would impact the service level of flower beds and horticulture material supplied at various parks. Any additional reductions would severely impact weed spraying throughout the City. Reductions in the Forestry division may impact the timing of tree maintenance and clean up of fallen debris throughout the City parkland and right of ways.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	(145,575)				
Forestry	Hourly-Temporary	(58,830)				
Horticulture General Exp.	Hourly-Temporary	(303,654)				
Ojibway & Natural Areas	Hourly-Temporary	(70,218)				
Parks Operations	Hourly-Temporary	(780,506)				
	Total Expenses	(1,358,783)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(1,358,783)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0135	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Parks	Status	Public

Reduction of Forestry Contract Work

This issue will remove all funding required to hire external contractors to perform tree trimming, high risk tree removals, planting, stump removal, and tree watering services. This issue will have an extreme impact on the current levels of service as well as increase areas of risk related to maintenance of the urban forest canopy that plays a vital function in climate change adaptation. The work is scalable to reduce the entire contract work. However, any reduction may result in a decline in tree health and increased risk to the public. This reduction would represent a regression in the level of tree maintenance service levels experienced over the recent years and there will not be sufficient funding in place to replace trees in an effort to protect the tree canopy cover of the City.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

The City of Windsor Parks Department is responsible for the maintenance and care of approximately 70,000 street trees along the Right-of-Way and 20,000 trees within our City parks. The Forestry Division consists of one Manager, two Supervisors, one Asset Analyst and ten full-time unionized staff. They carry out the day-to-day operations of managing the urban forest including: tree trimming, tree removals, storm clean-up, service request inspections and tree planting. The protection of the urban forest has never been more important to our well being. Trees provide us with many social, health and psychological benefits, while providing cities with numerous environmental benefits such as storm water retention and the cooling effect trees have on our neighbourhoods. Like any city owned asset, trees should be protected and maintained regularly.

Although the quality of work completed by internal staff is of a high standard, our staffing numbers do not provide the required hours to complete the necessary work. As a result, many of these services are contracted out to tree care contractors in an effort to deliver the services in a timely manner. Contracted services supplement our current internal workforce and allow us to deal with the high number of tree removals currently needed due to our aging tree population.

In 2022, the Forestry Division received over 5,360 calls for service through Windsor's 311 Customer Service Department. For 2023, the service requests are at 6,353 for the period ended July 2023.

In 2023, the available operating budget for contracts is \$387,625. The elimination of these maintenance contracts in the Forestry operating budget would further delay the activities within Forestry division's attempt to continue to maintain tree inventory and protect valuable tree assets within the City. As a result, this elimination is NOT recommended by the department. The backlog in 311 tree trimming requests has been significantly reduced in 2023 and is within the Forestry industry standards and timelines for tree trimming. However, due to the volume of older trees in the City's tree inventory, multiple storm events have a negative impact on the City's trees, and a backlog in tree maintenance could quickly return in the near future as the frequency of storm events rise. Catching up on this backlog has allowed the Division to concentrate on accomplishing a higher percentage of pro active work on the City's youngest trees.

Risk

If Council elects to approve this budget reduction, the health of the Urban Forest will begin to deteriorate as well as the risk of trees damaging private property will increase. The gains the division has made in reducing the backlog over the recent years will be lost, as calls for maintenance to 311 will begin to significantly rise. Also, as mature trees continue to be removed from the program, there will not be sufficient funding in place to replace these trees in an effort to protect and bolster the canopy cover of the City. Currently there is \$185,175 for the costs of contracts and new tree planting. The tree canopy is an important tool to combat climate change.

Number of Forestry 311 Service Requests

Type of Service Request	2021	2022	2023 JULY YTD	TOTALS
Tree Limbs, Maintenance and Storm	2,746	2,482	4,056	9,284
Tree Trimming	2,126	1,585	1,215	4,926
Tree Planting and Watering	523	375	262	1,160
Tree and Stump Removals	999	920	820	2,739
TOTAL FORESTRY SERVICE REQUESTS	6,394	5,362	6,353	18,109

The above chart displays details of the type of service calls received by the Forestry department through the 311 Customer Service Department. The service calls in 2022 were over 5,360. The average service request to date in 2023 is 907 per month. The average service request for 2022 was 446 per month, which represented an increase of 49% in 2023.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Forestry	Contracted Services	(387,625)				
	Total Expenses	(387,625)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(387,625)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0149	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Facilities Operations	Status	Public

Elimination of Preventative Maintenance Budgets at Facilities Buildings

This budget issue eliminates the preventative maintenance and all building repair budgets for all of Facilities building portfolio except for buildings that have a formal maintenance agreement with the external partners. Eliminating this service would have serious negative implications such as increasing risk and liability to the Corporation due to building/equipment breakdowns and increasing costs as a result of emergency repairs.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

This budget issue is created to achieve the requested target budget reduction by eliminating the Preventive Maintenance and Building Repair budget for all the buildings in the Facilities portfolio except for Windsor Justice Facility (WJF), Department of National Defence (DND), and other tenant facilities where Facilities is liable for the building maintenance bound by contract agreements.

The goal of preventative maintenance is to improve the performance of equipment and safety of the facility as a whole. Eliminating all preventative maintenance budget would have a negative impact on the Corporation as a whole since preventative maintenance is an important part of facilities management. The benefits of preventative maintenance are as follows:

- Timely, routine repairs help to avoid larger scale repairs at a significant cost
- Increased life expectancy of assets thereby limiting premature replacement of equipment
- Reduced overtime costs of maintenance workers due to fewer unplanned repair work
- Improved safety and quality conditions of the facility as a whole

The Facilities areas where the Preventive Maintenance budget would be impacted include the following:

- Non-Campus locations - Fire Halls, Police facilities, Capitol Theatre, the homeless shelter, Public Works Administration, Records storage
- Western Downtown - Windsor International Aquatic Training Centre, Duff Baby House
- Parks & Rec Admin - All parks facilities and administration buildings, recreations and community centres.

Risk

Preventative maintenance is required to ensure that equipment continues to operate properly and efficiently, and the facility is safe for residents and staff. It is an important control for the City's Infrastructure enterprise risk and elimination of these services would increase the City's exposure to this risk.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fac.Ops. -Non-Campus	Maintenance Parts & Materials	(70,500)				

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fac.Ops. -Parks & Rec	Maintenance Parts & Materials	(132,500)				
Fac.Ops. - Western Downtown	Maintenance Parts & Materials	(120,000)				
	Total Expenses	(323,000)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(323,000)	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0256	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Parks	Status	Public

Reduction of Hanging Basket and Planter Program

To reduce the volume of the hanging basket and planter program throughout the City by 25% for BIAs, gateways, corridors, parkland and facilities. This issue will have an impact on the level of service and beautification efforts currently being provided throughout the City. The elimination of this program would not promote economic development activities and would be in contradiction to the 20-year strategic plan and vision for the City of Windsor. As a result, a reduction of the program is more viable than the complete elimination.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

The hanging basket program was introduced through the Green City Initiative with the objective to install self-watering planters and hanging baskets to create an aesthetically appealing floral display in the City’s BIAs and main arterial roadways and corridors.

The City currently supplies over 1,200 hanging baskets and bridge planters, along with 900 self-watering planters throughout the City. The hanging baskets planters materials are contracted to be supplied by an external party. The planter program is managed by parks operations staff. There is one exception in the fixed planters installed as part of BIA streetscaping improvements, The fixed planters are the responsibility of the BIAs to maintain with Parks supplying the plant materials at the beginning of the season.

The operating budget for the hanging baskets and planter program is \$102,801 and could be lowered should this service reduction option be approved. These savings include the materials used for this program along with internal rental costs for the water truck to maintain these baskets and planters. The chart below highlights that a 25% reduction in the volume of hanging baskets and planter would yield savings of \$25,700.

This budget elimination could be viewed by the public as a significant reduction in level of service as the beautification of the City would be impaired with a reduction in floral displays related to bridges, gateways and major corridors throughout the City.

Risk

The hanging basket and planter program is a significant part of the City’s beautification efforts. Reduction of this program could increase the City’s exposure to the Portrayal enterprise risk, identified as a priority for 2019-2020.

Details of Hanging Basket and Planter Reduction Program

Budget Category	Annual Budget	20% Reduction
Hanging Basket	\$50,000	\$10,000
Fixed Planters	\$20,000	\$4,000
Portable Planters	\$45,000	\$9,000
Water Truck	\$10,252	\$2,050
TOTAL	\$125,252	\$25,050

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Horticulture General Exp.	Infrastructure Maint. Material	(23,138)				
Horticulture General Exp.	VehicleRent-TempOther INTERNAL	(2,562)				
	Total Expenses	(25,700)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(25,700)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0148	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Facilities Operations	Status	Public

Elimination of Budget for Facilities Pest Control

This budget issue eliminates the Pest Control budget at City facilities within the maintenance portfolio. Eliminating this service would have serious negative implications such as increasing risk of pest and insect infestation and posing major health and safety issues for the employees and the general public.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The contracted pest control service providers keep various City facilities free of rodents and pest infestations. The monthly service provides population control and prevention of pests, rodents and bed bugs. Over the years there have been various incidents of bed bug infestations at City facilities. Each reported incidents were addressed by necessary treatments. Acceptance of this issue would halt the pest control services at City facilities and will likely lead to an increase in pest and insect population at City facilities.

Risk

Eliminating this service would have serious negative implications such as increasing risk of pest and insect infestation and posing major health and safety issues for the employees and the general public.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fac.Ops. -Non-Campus	Contracted Services	(40,000)				
	Total Expenses	(40,000)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(40,000)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0129	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Parks	Status	Public

Trail Maintenance Budget

The Parks department is requesting an additional trail maintenance budget of \$150,000 for the annual maintenance for crack filling, sealing, as well as asphalt replacements on existing trails where necessary. There is currently an annual budget of \$250,000 allocated for this activity in the Parks operating budget. This requested increase will help with the preventative maintenance and extend the life cycle of the asset. Trails were identified by the community as the most important feature in future parks development, which has been noted in the Parks Master Plan. The maintenance budget would serve to meet the recommendations of the Active Transportation Master Plan approved by Council. This funding would also be used to widen trails to meet accessibility standards

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

The Parks Department is responsible for the maintenance of over 170 km of asphalted trails, multiple stone trails and off-road cycling trails. The trail infrastructure is a key feature throughout all parks in the City. It is estimated that 80% of existing trails are in need of significant repairs as capital budget funding has only addressed replacement of trails which are beyond their useful lives or need to be addressed as part of another capital project improvement. In addition, current inflationary cost pressure on construction materials have yielded additional costs on the Parks department to maintain current service levels for trail maintenance activities.

Historically ad-hoc repairs were made based on complaints received however with the introduction of the trail maintenance budget in 2019, Parks has begun to maintain trails that are in need of repairs. This annual maintenance budget will allow the Parks department to continue to adopt strong asset management principles to ensure that the expected useful life of trails is being optimized and any deficiencies are being addressed to protect the public from any safety concerns. With the addition of this annual maintenance budget administration, will be able to prioritize trails that need immediate maintenance. In addition the funding would be used to widen trails to meet accessibility standards.

In 2019, Council approved the Active Transportation Master plan which includes the enhanced maintenance of multi-use trails that are located throughout the City within various parklands. In order to ensure adequate service levels in high periods of use and safety throughout the year, additional funding is required to ensure trails can be maintained to support the initiatives as identified in the Active Transportation Master Plan. The Active Transportation Master Plan referenced the action below:

ACTION 1C.4: DEVELOP A DEDICATED FUNDING PROGRAM FOR THE PARKS DEPARTMENT TO IMPROVE, MAINTAIN, AND DEVELOP NEW PATHWAYS AND TRAILS.

Through the development of the Active Transportation Master Plan, the location of new pathways and trails as well as improvements to existing facilities were identified. Many of the existing and future pathways that are located within parks would be under the City's Parks Department jurisdiction rather than the Transportation Department. As a result, funding improvements to existing pathways, as well as installing new pathways in these locations would be undertaken by the Parks Department. Ensuring the Parks department has a dedicated funding program to make these projects possible will be necessary to ensure the long-term vision for active transportation in the City of Windsor.

Capital Budget Implication

Maintenance funding is required each year for trails to ensure the estimated useful life of the trails is maintained and avoid capital expenditures before the end of the life cycles. Capital funding has been identified in the Parks capital 10 year forecast under project PFO-012-12 Park Trails Capital Improvements and is to address ongoing refurbishment of sections of trails, including asphalt and granular base, to ensure that the City’s 120km trail system remains safe and usable.

The average life span of an asphalt trail is 15-20 years. Major trails such as the Ganatchio Trail south, Grande Marais trail, Southwood Lakes and inter park trails are approaching the end of their lifecycle. Parks currently maintains over 120km of trails in the system. The 2017 Parks Master Plan identified trails to be one of the most important recreational amenities in parks.

Risk

The establishment of dedicated maintenance budgets for the City’s infrastructure is an important mitigation strategy for the City’s critical Infrastructure enterprise risk. Ensuring proper maintenance is conducted will help prevent trails from degrading to the extent that they need to be replaced or closed, lessening the City’s exposure to this risk and liability.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Parks Operations	Infrastructure Maint. Material	150,000				
	Total Expenses	150,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	150,000	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0130	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Parks	Status	Public

Parking Lots Maintenance For City Parkland

To increase budget funding for maintenance of parking lots located at parkland throughout the city. The activities include crack sealing of asphalt and basin repairs to ensure adequate drainage. Currently there are 98 parking lots within City parkland that are utilized for those visiting parks. The maintenance funding allows for a portion of the parking lot inventory to be repaired to reduce costly and disruptive capital replacement. The funding for this activity is subject to current inflationary trends with rising price in construction materials for repair and external contracted services.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

A significant portion of the parking lots associated with parks is in need of repairs and maintenance. The City owns 98 parking lots that are associated with parkland and many of these assets are in need of maintenance. The activities that are required involve asphalt repairs for crack sealing and basin repairs. These repairs are critical to ensure the safety of users of the parks along with ensuring the estimated life of the parking lots are maintained.

Parks administration is requesting an increase of \$150,000 to the existing operating budget to address the ongoing maintenance and repairs that are deemed necessary within the parking lot inventory based upon an annual conditional assessment and ongoing review. There is currently a \$75,000 operating budget for this activity within the Parks department.

This budget funding will also mitigate some of the inflationary cost trends with construction materials that would be required for large capital replacement of parking lots and allow for smaller scope repairs in an attempt to maintain the estimated useful life of parking lots.

Capital Budget Implication

Capital funding for parking lot have been identified under budget ID PFO-013-12 Park-Related Parking Lots for complete renovations and repaving of specific parking lots over the 10 year forecast period. However there are many parking lots that are in need of smaller operating maintenance activities which is the purpose of this funding request.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Parks Operations	Contracted Services	150,000				
	Total Expenses	150,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	150,000	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0145	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Parks & Facilities	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Facilities Operations	Status	Public

Park Structures - Roof Maintenance & Repairs

This budget issue is to establish an annual operating budget for Facilities to provide maintenance and repairs to the roofs of the park shelters and gazebos. Facilities is responsible for inspection and maintenance repairs for all roofs at City facilities. There is only capital budget for major roof replacements for building structures, but no operating budget for annual repairs towards park shelters and gazebos. Facilities is requesting \$90,000 to provide necessary roofing maintenance and repairs the park shelters and gazebos in the City.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

As part of the responsibility of the position, Facilities Roof Technologist travels to all the facilities in the maintenance portfolio across the City and provides regular inspections to determine the condition of the roofs on building structures and make recommendations of any necessary repairs or replacements. The scope has generally been focusing on the roofing attached to a building structure. As these Park shelters and gazebos age, there has been increasing needs to maintain and repair the roofs on these structures in order to prolong their lifespan and usefulness.

Currently there are 34 park shelters and gazebos across the City, however, there is no operating budget established in Facilities to maintain the roofs on these park shelters and gazebos. Whereas most of the roof replacements of the building structures are capital in nature, the maintenance for these park shelters and gazebos are less comprehensive and should be addressed by operating budget.

Facilities is requesting permanent funding of \$90,000 in the operating budget to be established for the roof maintenance and repairs on the park shelter and gazebos. It is estimated that it would cost \$30,000 to repair the roof of a park shelter, and Facilities would repair approximately three shelters per year.

Risk

Should this budget issue not be approved by Council, the City may increase its exposure to the Infrastructure enterprise risk. The shortfall in the operating budget could have an impact on the level of maintenance service provided to the roofing components of the park shelters and gazebos in the City. This could decrease the functionality of the shelters and may even lead to safety concerns of the general public if left unaddressed.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fac.Ops. -Parks & Rec	Contracted Services	90,000				
	Total Expenses	90,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	90,000	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0133	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Recreation & Culture	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Community Development	Status	Public

One Additional RFT Special Events Coordinator

Establishment of an additional Special Events Coordinator position will allow for the opportunity to sustain and increase opportunities for City led events and to continue to attract, support and meet expanding customer needs for these services. Initiatives like Open Streets, Bright Lights and increased event hosting opportunities being requested through community initiatives and generated through Sports Tourism require year-round and multi-layered resources to plan and operate these events.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

There are a significant number of events that happen on municipal properties and private locations, both utilizing the existing resources of the special events division within the community event area. The overall responsibility to provide the highest level of customer service to the event organizers as well as foster and maintain positive relationships with our clients is a key performance factor within this area resource team.

Currently this area has one Special Events Supervisor, one Special Events Coordinator, and one RFT Recreation Clerk to assist in the execution of City Led and Community initiated events. The Manager of Culture and Events also assists regularly in this overall responsibility. Reporting requirements and the assurances of compliance pertaining to all regulations assist in minimizing risk and requires resources to be deployed, nights, weekends and holidays on a regular basis.

Over the past 3 years a substantial interest and growth has been noted pertaining to both large and small events, and current trends indicate further growth opportunities, requests and associated support that will be needed for the future.

The new position of Special Events Coordinator would allow the department to continue to provide internal and external support for events and facilities such as:

- The annual Mayor’s Walk and Windsor’s Annual Birthday celebration
- Open Streets
- Bright Lights Windsor
- Large and Medium scaled events hosted within our outdoor City facilities including but not limited to; Festival Plaza, Lanspeary Arena and Park, Willistead Park, Charles Clark Square, Vision Corridor, Windsor Waterfront trail and Sculpture Park, Dieppe Park, Reaume Park and Malden Park, etc.
- Special Event Street closures
- Future opportunities similar to the International Children’s Games, Ontario Summer Games, Ontario 55+ Games, CanAm Police Fire Games, FINA Swimming or Diving, the Memorial Cup, and the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, to name a few

In order to achieve optimal customer service objectives and operational requirements in future growth additional staffing resources are being requested to assist in this achievement.

Establishment of this additional position will allow for the opportunity to both increase opportunities for event hosting and succession planning to continue the expanding customer needs for these services.

Should this position not be accepted on a permanent basis, Administration is requesting one-time funding of \$108,760 to assist with the high volume of demands for new events that the department is receiving from the community.

4 Year Historical on Number of Community Events (Excluding Pandemic Years)

	2018	2019	2022	YTD 2023
Community Events	134	441	459	379

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	26,591				
Culture & Events	Cell Phones	600				
Culture & Events	PC & Maint. Allocation	1,000				
Culture & Events	Salary-Reg.Full Time	80,569				
	Total Expenses	108,760	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	108,760	0	0	0	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Recreation & Culture	Culture & Events	Coordinator, Special Events	Regular Full-Time	1.0
			Total:	1.0

Budget Issue #	2024-0264	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Recreation & Culture	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Cultural Affairs	Status	Public

Increase of the Arts Culture and Heritage Funding

This budget issue recommends an increase of \$32,000 to the Arts Culture & Heritage Fund (ACHF), which is provided to local organizations & individuals developing community cultural projects, to encourage the growth of the creative community in Windsor. An additional \$50,000 is requested to create a new fund for operating costs experienced by the ACHF community. The ACHF provides an opportunity for creatives to develop new skills & broaden community arts engagement. Program investments have a direct impact on the creative sector, and ripple effects on our creative economy, making arts, culture & heritage key ingredients to economic growth & diversification. This request is consistent with recommendations within the Municipal Cultural Master Plan.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Recreation and Culture is recommending an increase to the annual funding for the Arts Culture and Heritage Fund (ACHF), in the amount of \$32,000 to increase the annual operating budget to \$150,000 and an additional \$50,000 to create a new fund under the ACHF umbrella directly relating to operating costs experienced by the ACHF community. Annual funding shortfalls for successful applicants have averaged \$31,000 for the past several years. The requested increase will assist in providing additional support toward funding recipients as well as new growth which will support growth of the arts, culture and heritage communities in the City of Windsor.

When Council approved the program’s launch in 2014, the funding envelope was set using 218,000 as the estimated population for the City of Windsor based on the 2016 Canada Census of Population. The 2021 Census was completed in May 2021. While results are yet to be published and the official number must come from Statistics Canada, Windsor is estimated to have a population in 2021 of around 338,000 according to unofficial population estimators (<https://www.macrotrends.net/cities/20406/windsor/population>; <https://worldpopulationreview.com/world-cities/windsor-population>).

Contained within the Municipal Cultural Master Plan is the following:

Recommendation #7 Establish arm’s length Cultural Funding Commission
 -Establish an arm’s length funding commission to help support the growth of the arts, culture and heritage communities in the City of Windsor.

In 2015, Council approved \$55,000 in base funding with an additional \$32,200 coming from existing funding to establish the ACHF. Thus far, and through 15 rounds of funding, a combined total of \$714,000 has been issued for Arts Culture and Heritage Funding. This includes 2 rounds of funding for the Pilot Project in 2014 and 2 Rounds each year from 2015-2021. During that time funding requests totaling \$2,318,121 have been received with the total value of all projects completed far exceeding the value of the grants provided.

The Arts Culture and Heritage Fund (ACHF grant program) has had a significant impact on the community of Windsor through the artists and historians being able to see projects through to fruition, through the involved artists, neighbourhoods and communities impacted by the projects, and for the audiences experiencing the highly creative results. The value of the requests are consistently higher than the amount of funding available for distribution. While it is important that the fund remains a competitive process, there are excellent projects that are coming forward which are currently not possible to fund. Each funding round, the ACHF jury selects a strong mix of projects across genres including

the visual and fine arts, performing arts, film, music, literary arts and storytelling, podcasts, and some important projects surrounding diversity, inclusivity, multiculturalism, heritage and the celebration of humanity in the City of Windsor.

The ACHF program is held in high esteem by members of the local creative community - both those funded to complete projects, and those involved in or experiencing the projects. Funded artists are required to complete a post-project report that includes an opportunity to provide direct feedback on the program. The ACHF program is adjudicated by a volunteer jury made up of members of the local arts, culture and heritage community. Of their collective experience working as part of the ACHF Jury for the 2021 funding rounds, the jurors said: “The experience as an ACHF juror is fulfilling... it is so encouraging to see so many artists and arts organizations continuing to pursue such wonderful projects... I would recommend this experience to anyone in the arts, culture and heritage sector, and I am so appreciative of the work done by City Administration that brings the dreams of these artists into our reality. Windsor is a much better city for it... Windsor is a mecca of creativity.”

The ACHF provides stability and opportunity for individuals and community organizations to experiment, develop new skills, and create programs that they may not have taken the chance on exploring without the availability of the fund. The profile of culture in Windsor has risen across the province as the quality and quantity of local work is becoming well known and highly regarded.

Performance Indicators

For 2021 MBNCanada Culture measure Culture Grants per Capita, Windsor has a result of \$1.49 which is below the median of \$7.18

Arts Culture and Heritage Funding

Year	Budget	Funding Request	Funding Shortfall	
2022	\$118,000	\$??	(\$??)	Council approved annual increase of \$30,800
2021	\$87,200	\$285,520	(\$198,320)	Council approved one-time increase of \$16,400
2020	\$103,600	\$278,396	(\$174,796)	
2019	\$87,200	\$327,000	(\$239,800)	
2018	\$87,200	\$278,095	(\$190,895)	

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Culture & Events	Grants from City	32,000				
Culture & Events	Operating and Other Supplies	50,000				
	Total Expenses	82,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	82,000	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0265	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Recreation & Culture	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Cultural Affairs	Status	Public

Increase to Open Streets Event Operating Budget

This budget issue recommends an increase in operating budget of \$88,500 to support the costs to host one Open Streets Event in the east end of Windsor and one in the west end on an annual basis.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

This budget issue builds on the existing annual operating budget for the operation of Open Streets Windsor. At the Wednesday, September 6, 2023, Community Service Standing Committee Administration was directed to create both an east end and a west end Open Streets route and to host two Open Streets events on an annual basis.

Open Streets are unique events that have been held in over 100 cities in North America and involve the temporary closure of roadways to vehicular traffic, allowing people to use them for a host of healthy and fun physical activities like walking, cycling, yoga, dancing and fitness. The goals of Open Streets are to encourage active transportation and physical activity; encourage community building activities; promote community-led active living initiatives; showcase recently improved streetscapes; provide an opportunity for local businesses and organizations to participate along the route.

In February of 2016, City Council adopted CR87/2016 which granted approval for two Open Streets Pilot Projects in July and September of 2016.

On May 29, 2017 report #C 76/2017 reported to City Council on the completion and success of the 2016 Open Streets Pilot Project and the 2017 Ontario 150 grant which was used to continue Open Streets in 2017. City Council formally approved "Open Streets Windsor: An Ontario 150 Celebration" through CR313/2017. The event date was confirmed for September 17, 2017, with extended hours and a budget of \$74,400. At the January 15, 2018, Special Meeting - 2018 Operating and Capital Budget, report #B27/2018 approved Open Streets Windsor 2018, and in 2019 a portion of the event was moved from University to Riverside Drive which remained in place for 2021 and 2022. Open Streets did not occur in 2020 due to pandemic restrictions.

On February 13, 2023, Councillor Gignac presented a petition on behalf of the Olde Riverside Town Centre BIA and Pilette Village BIA regarding Open Streets with a request that the event either commence on the East side of Windsor or be extended to include the areas listed. In March 2023, the City's Special Events staff and members of Special Events Resources Team (SERT) met to discuss the options for an eastern-focused route in 2024 of similar size, goals and scope as the downtown/west-side route. City Administration will work with SERT and the east-side BIAs (Olde Riverside, Pilette Village, Ottawa, Ford City and Erie Street) to establish a route that ensures participant enjoyment and safety.

The current annual operating budget of \$61,500 for one Open Streets event is for operating expenditures pertaining to hosting such as; marketing/advertising, police, crossing guards, Emergency Services, barricades, signage, fencing, signage, volunteers, sanitation and refuse. However, the costs associated with the event continue to grow in the recent years due to inflationary pressure, the estimated cost is \$75,000 to host each event. If sponsorship revenues materialize, the net City operating costs for the year would be reduced accordingly. Administration is requesting \$150,000 annually to support the costs associated with hosting two Open Streets Events.

Participating in the Open Streets movement offers numerous community benefits related to physical activity, active transportation, and social, economic, environmental, and civic pride. It is recommended that this issue be approved in

the proposed 2024 operating budget request to continue to grow and develop both events and continue to support what has become a favorite community building event.

Risk

The Open Streets event is a strong mitigation tool for the City’s Portrayal enterprise risk. Hosting these types of events promotes a positive message about the City, its livability and opportunities. Without increased funding hosting two successful events would not be possible.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Culture & Events	Advertising	24,000				
Culture & Events	Contracted Services	8,000				
Culture & Events	INTERNAL Services-non-salary	49,500				
Culture & Events	Other Prof Services-External	7,000				
	Total Expenses	88,500	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	88,500	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0303	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Community Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Recreation & Culture	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Community Centres & Programming	Status	Public

Summer Drop-In Recreation Program in Parks

Council directed Administration (CR200/2023) in 2023 to collaborate with Downtown Windsor Community Collaborative (DWCC) to provide an 8-week community drop in Summer Jobs Pilot Program at Mitchell Park. Should Council wish to continue the free summer drop-in program at one or more locations, annual budget will need to be established to cover the costs of staffing, program equipment & supplies, and security services associated with the program.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

On May 29, 2023, Council directed Administration (CR200/2023) to initiate a community drop in Summer Jobs Pilot Program for 2023 at Mitchell Park for a maximum of 8 weeks, as outlined in the administrative report (C 40/2023) and in collaboration with The Downtown Windsor Community Collaborative with funding of \$19,500 plus applicable taxes to be funded from the Budget Stabilization Reserve (BSR) Account. In discussions with the DWCC it was discovered that they had a number of initiatives in the downtown area including offering free outdoor programming for youth at other locations. The DWCC indicated that they did not have enough staffing to offer daily programming at Mitchell Park and following City Council's direction, a community partnership for a summer pilot was initiated. The 2-month pilot, offered during the months of July and August 2023 involved free drop in programming at Mitchell Park with staff from the DWCC being provided 3 nights per week and City of Windsor staff being onsite 4 nights per week.

Once onsite, programming staff had a supply of equipment and offered various types of sports and games of low organization for participants who attended. With the focus of the program being oversight and safety supervision by the staff, minimal instructions were offered to participants. A portable washroom was located onsite for staff and park users and was locked at the end of each day to deter vandalism. Access for staff to water via a portable cooler, as well as equipment, a first aid and a pop up shelter or tent to provide relief for staff from the elements was provided for the program.

The 2023 pilot project included a security officer who was available at Mitchell Park from 6pm to 9pm on a daily basis and, in addition to deterring unwanted activity at Mitchell Park, the security officer was available to address any safety issues during the last hour of programming for both the DWCC and the City. This was beneficial and the need should be assessed on a park-by-park basis should this program expand to other areas in the City.

Moving forward, if the program was to continue at one or more locations, the Recreation Department would need to purchase pop up tents that are able to withstand unexpected weather changes and also budget for annual replacement of all equipment as high use and/or removal of the equipment from the site resulted in no usable equipment inventory by the end of the program.

Administration is requesting an annual budget of \$43,000 for the City to run the 8-week program at two separate park sites in the City, assuming similar partnerships will be established to provide staffing resource 3 nights per week throughout the length of the 8-week program. The annual cost includes stationing two students per site, replacement of program equipment (such as portable shelter, tablets, walkie-talkies, and staff clothing,) rental of portable washroom and vehicle, and security services. Currently there is no budget, besides the one-time funding approved for the pilot program in 2023, for this drop-in recreation program. Administration will explore the option of applying for students for the 2024 season through the Canada Summer Job program, but it is not guaranteed that the proposed positions would fit with the 2024 funding criteria of the grant.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Community Programming & Develm	Contracted Services	8,500				
Community Programming & Develm	Hourly-Temporary	13,500				
Community Programming & Develm	Program Supplies	21,000				
	Total Expenses	43,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	43,000	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0244	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Pollution Control	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	LRWRP Operations	Status	Public

Budget Reduction Contribution to Pollution Control Reserve

Reflects a reduction in Reserve funding which ensures the ongoing replacement of the aging equipment at the City's two Pollution Control Plants and numerous pumping stations. Decreased contributions to Pollution Control Reserves would be considered a critical risk as sufficient funding would not be readily available to address replacement of the equipment when deemed necessary.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Pollution Control has one reserve fund, established to ensure that ongoing replacement of aging equipment takes place at the Lou Romano Water Reclamation Plant (LRWRP), Little River Pollution Control Plant (LRPCP) and the numerous pump stations throughout the City of Windsor.

As of July 31, 2023 the reserve balance, net of encumbrances, is \$370,110. The Pollution Control Reserve is projected to be in a budgeted deficit of \$520,000 by the end of 2023.

Currently, the reserve receives annual contributions from the Sanitary Sewer Surcharge as follows:

\$882,478 Pumping Stations
 \$2,947,304 LRWRP
 \$4,737,963 LRPCP

TOTAL: \$8,567,745

The annual contributions from the sewer surcharge were increased during the 2022 budget process by \$1,250,000 from \$6,067,745 and again by \$1,250,000 in 2023 to their current levels. Even with the increased annual contributions, and given the current level of planned spending at the plants and pumping stations, the reserve is anticipated to be in a deficit by 2024.

Reserves are reviewed and refined annually to reflect current events and planning and take inflation into consideration. In order to meet fiscal targets, reductions in the contribution to the Pollution Control Reserve have been considered.

None of the following five options are recommended, however, they are presented to provide City Council with options to achieve its' fiscal targets.

Option 1: 10% reduction of \$856,775

Option 2: A reduction of \$959,831 to meet the 5% reduction target.

Option 3: 25% reduction of \$2,141,936

Option 4: 50% reduction of \$4,283,873

Option 5: 75% reduction of \$6,425,809

Should a reduction to the reserve be accepted, dedicated funding would not be readily available to address replacement of equipment in these critical facilities.

Risk

The proposed reduction would increase the Corporation’s exposure to the Infrastructure enterprise risk, identified as a priority for 2018-2019, by counteracting the mitigation strategy of continuing to enhance reserve funds.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
LRPCP Operations (Sewer Surcharge)	Depreciation				(530,786)	
LRWRP Operations (Sewer Surcharge)	Depreciation				(330,182)	
Pump Station-Operations (Sewer Surcharge)	Depreciation				(98,863)	
	Total Expenses	0	0	0	(959,831)	0
	Net Total	0	0	0	(959,831)	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0214	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[1] Budget Increase
Department	Public Works	Category	[G] Line Item Increase
Division	Environmental Services	Status	Public

Increase Transfer to Capital for Waste / Roll-Off Bin Replacement Program

This issue will increase the annual contribution to the capital project for the replacement and addition of waste disposal bins for the front-end loader and roll off truck service area of Environmental services. The front-end loader and roll off services are provided to City Departments / Divisions as well as external customers under established contracts. The various waste bins have an expected life cycle of 8 to 12 years depending on the material collected and frequency of use.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The Corporation currently owns (150) 6-yard waste bins, (8) 4-yard waste bins, (30 - 40) refurbished waste bins, and (19) roll off truck bins. The bins have a life expectancy of approximately 10-years at which time they will need replacement. The funding source to purchase replacement or additional bins is a transfer from the operating budget, and currently the annual transfer of \$15,000 is insufficient to meet the demands for bin replacements and the addition of (6) new roll off bins.

Administration has determined that approximately \$45,000 / year is required to fully fund the capital program. Environmental has an existing budget of \$15,000.

Replacement costs for bins has increased during and post COVID. Administration has factored in a 3% inflation factor when calculating the capital plan and operating requirements.

Revenue related to bin collection services is evaluated with adjustments and fee increases submitted through the annual user fee budget issue, 2024-0009 for 2024.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Environmental Services	TRANSFER to Capital Fund	30,000				
	Total Expenses	30,000	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	30,000	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0124	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Public Works	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Technical Support	Status	Public

Eliminate Annual Hansen Software Maintenance & Support Fee

This budget issue proposes elimination of the annual software maintenance & support fees paid for the Infor Hansen infrastructure management system used by Public Works & corporately for asset management of municipal infrastructure (roads, sewers, etc). Fees cover new software releases/updates, software fixes/patches, support services, online resources, & documentation. Cancelling the agreement would result in negative impacts to system growth and development, staff and system downtime, costs, productivity, and could result in system failure.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The Hansen Infor infrastructure management software system is the Public Works infrastructure asset management system and work order management system used by Public Works to track & record infrastructure assets, work order histories, inspections, condition ratings, and repairs performed. The system is used to manage the road network assets, sewer & drainage networks, bridges, sidewalks, railway grade crossings, private drain connections, and more. The system and associated data is used in day-to-day operational planning and in long term planning. The system is also used by Parks Forestry to manage the tree inventory and related forestry activities. Other departments such as Engineering, Geomatics, Finance - TCA, Finance - Asset Planning, and Risk Management are reliant on data maintained in the Hansen system. In addition, the corporate EIS/GIS system is interfaced directly to the Hansen system. The Hansen software maintenance & support agreement fees are paid annually to the software vendor Infor and are necessary in order to continue receiving software support, enhancements, and software updates from the vendor.

If the fees are not paid, the vendor Infor will discontinue the Hansen software maintenance and support agreement. The Corporation will not receive any software enhancements, new updated software version releases, documentation updates, software patches and fixes. These are currently covered by the software maintenance and support agreement. The current software version will become out-of-date, if the software is not upgraded to keep pace with industry and corporate technology changes, it will become incompatible to hardware and the other software (e.g. operating systems, web browsers, databases, mobile technology, etc.) that it must interact with in order to operate. In addition, the vendor's online and telephone software support services and resources will be discontinued and Corporate staff (Public Works, Parks, & IT) will not have access to the vendor's software product expertise to answer questions and resolve functional, technical, and database issues that arise in the use of the system and as purchased software functionalities are investigated for further implementation. Access to on-line user forums and on-line knowledge base will also be discontinued. There will be negative impacts to system growth & development, staff & system downtime, costs, productivity, and could result in data loss and failures. If the agreement is cancelled (i.e. fees are not paid), future reinstatement of the software maintenance and support agreement would require that the Corporation pay for any lapsed (i.e. unpaid) maintenance and support periods plus an Infor reinstatement charge at the time of reinstatement as per Infor policy. This would result in higher costs and loss of any short-term savings.

Risk

Eliminating Hansen software maintenance and support would increase the Corporation's exposure to the Technology Fails enterprise risk and the infrastructure enterprise risk, identified as priorities in the 2019 assessment. Due to the importance of the Hansen system to the City's operations, the occurrence of a technology failure in this area would have significant consequences.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Technical Support	Contracted Services	(47,157)				
Technical Support (Sewer Surcharge)	TRANSFER to Current Fund				(23,579)	
	Total Expenses	(47,157)	0	0	(23,579)	0
Technical Support	Sewer Surcharge Recoveries	23,579				
	Total Revenues	23,579	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(23,578)	0	0	(23,579)	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0223	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Public Works	Category	[K] Service Reduction
Division	Contracts, Field Services & Maintenance	Status	Public

Reduce Residential Snow Clearing and Salting

Acceptance of this reduction would result in a 6.2% decrease to the 2023 winter control budget and would move the standard for snow clearing on residential streets from 4 inches to 6 inches in one event and eliminate snow removal and salting of City sidewalks. The consequence of this reduction would be icy road conditions in residential areas following a significant snowfall of more than 4 inches but less than 6 inches. This will expose the City to additional liability claims due to unsafe sidewalks and roadways. We would also experience an increase in 311 calls and complaints requiring additional staff time to address.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Currently, residential streets are cleared of snow after a snow fall event of 4 inches. The 4 inch standard was adopted during the 2007 Budget (previously, the standard was 3 inches). This proposed service reduction would mean residential streets would not be cleared until after a snow fall event of 6 inches. In addition, we would no longer salt residential intersections until the snowfall event is in excess of 4" and we will no longer carry out any snow removal or salting of the 36 kms of sidewalks, 21.69kms of multi-use trails, 2.5kms of inner-block walkways, and 270 corners in BIA areas that are the responsibility of the Public Works Department to maintain. It should be noted that these sidewalks and trails are separate and apart from the trails that are maintained by the Parks Department.

Winter Control activities (plowing, salting, etc.) are performed on arterial and collector roads for every snowfall event. At present, when snowfalls are less than 4 inches, intersections are salted when conditions warrant; if the policy is changed to 6 inches, the number of salt applications and the amount of salt per application will be greater in order to melt the increased snow depths at intersections.

The average cost of Winter Control on arterials and collectors is approximately \$12,000 per hour. Under the current policy of 4-inch accumulation for residential plowing, the cost for clearing residential streets is approximately \$375,000 per event. This reduction is the equivalent of 1 residential street clearing rollout.

The consequence of this reduction would be icy road conditions in residential areas following a significant snowfall of more than 4 inches but less than 6 inches. This will expose the City to additional liability claims due to unsafe roadways. We would also experience an increase in 311 calls and complaints requiring additional staff time to address.

This reduction equates to a 6.2% reduction of the current 2023 budget of \$6,041,045 for winter control operations.

Performance Indicators

The 2021 operating costs for winter maintenance of roadways per lane km maintained in winter are calculated at \$2,302 which is currently well below the 2021 MBNC median of \$4,293.

Related Budget Issues:

Should Council accept this service reduction, related budget issues may need to be recalculated for inclusion at the new service level as follows:

** 2024-0109 - Increase Contract Costs for the Winter Maintenance of Municipal Roads

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
PW Maintenance	Contracted Services	(375,000)				
	Total Expenses	(375,000)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(375,000)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0102	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Public Works	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Administration - Public Works	Status	Public

Elimination of Student Labour

The elimination of students would reduce and eliminate services in the Environmental, Fleet, Maintenance, Traffic, Parking, and Technical Support Divisions. Impacted service would include clean up services, road/alley/sewer maintenance services, line/marketing painting services, sidewalk inspection and asset management services, and equipment audit requirements. Current full time staff do not have capacity within their normal duties and workloads to complete the work done by students each year. Much of the work completed is required legislatively. Should Council wish to proceed with a reduction of students, Administration would prioritize services and reduce accordingly.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

TECHNICAL SUPPORT:

Acceptance of this issue would result in the elimination of the annual sidewalk inspection program conducted by Technical Support which identifies sidewalk deficiencies and trip hazards and would lead to an increase in sidewalk trip and fall claims. It would also significantly impact the ongoing efforts relating to proper asset management for sewer, roads, and other municipal infrastructure.

This budget issue eliminates seasonal temporary staffing (ie. coop students and summer students). Students in Technical Support assist with the annual sidewalk inspection program identifying trip hazards and other sidewalk deficiencies in-the-field for repair and assist with other Asset Management initiatives. During the 2022 sidewalk inspection program: a total of 341 km of sidewalk was inspected, 2427 inspection records completed, over 28,185 deficiencies recorded, 105 high severity asphalt sidewalk deficiencies, and 2,484 urgent uplifts (ie. trip hazards) on concrete sidewalks were identified for repair. Additionally, the inspection program provides overall sidewalk condition ratings which are critical to capital rehabilitation planning and budgeting. The inspection program is also important in the legal defense against liability claims and in the prevention of claims.

Minimum Maintenance Standards regulation revisions adopted by the Ministry in 2010 formally outline the need to inspect sidewalks once per year. Under the City’s current sidewalk inspection program and available funding, it should be noted that a risk-based approach is used to establish the inspection frequency for a sidewalk segment based on the sidewalk’s pedestrian traffic level and last recorded condition rating. Based on this criteria, the inspection frequencies used range from a maximum of once per year to a minimum of once in a 4 year period. For example, a sidewalk in poor condition with high pedestrian traffic is inspected once per year while a sidewalk in excellent condition with low pedestrian traffic is scheduled for inspection once every 4 years. Process improvements were implemented in 2014 to increase the number of sidewalks inspected in a year. Additional improvements are being investigated in order to increase inspection frequencies.

Based on Risk Management data as of Dec. 2022 for the period from 2012 to 2022, 312 sidewalk trip and fall liability claims were filed against the City and the total amount paid out on these claims is currently \$4,274,138 and an additional \$1,473,804 in pending potential payouts pertaining to these claims is projected. (These claim costs do not include internal staff costs associated with investigating, researching, and defending liability claims nor any amounts exceeding the City’s insurance deductible. The deductible on general liability claims was increased from \$250,000 to \$500,000 in 2022.)

This staff also assists with other asset management tasks related to the municipal sewer, drainage, and road networks including data collection and verification for new and existing infrastructure asset inventories and assisting with ongoing programs and programs in development. This is important to asset data integrity, day-to-day field maintenance operations, short and long term operational and rehabilitation planning, fulfilling financial statement TCA requirements, and corporate asset planning initiatives. Without this staff we will not have the capability to support the corporate asset planning initiative.

This reduction will negatively impact our ability to execute existing programs and implement asset management and operational improvements. This reduction will eliminate the sidewalk inspection program which will lead to an increase in sidewalk trip and fall claims and the associated costs.

Elimination of students for the Technical Support Division would result in overall reductions to the municipal levy budget of (\$17,520) and the sewer surcharge budget of (\$17,520).

ENVIRONMENTAL:

Environmental Services hires 6 students during the summer months. These students provide the following services:

- Sweep and clean all underpasses at night
- Clean up all the commercial alleys
- Litter pick up, sweep and clean up the BIA's
- Litter pickup and maintenance of our yard
- Pickup and delivery of barricades for special events
- Illegal dump site cleanup
- Dead animal cleanup
- Clean up of debris, place zorball down motor vehicle accident locations
- Deliver garbage calendars
- Direct traffic at the Public Drop Off Facility

Should these positions be eliminated, the City would have difficulty properly staffing the Public Drop Off during summer months, providing delivery service for barricades for special events (many organizers do not have the capacity to pick up the barricades themselves), conducting illegal dumpsite clean ups, or providing litter clean up in Business Improvement Areas.

Furthermore, we would have to contract grass cutting services (for our yard), pay for delivery of notices to various businesses/homes regarding collection services, and require special event organizers to pick up and return barricades themselves as well as clean the roadway after their event (putting this responsibility on the event organizers does not exempt the Corporation from any liability should there be an incident involving public safety).

Elimination of students for the Environmental Services Division would result in overall reductions to the municipal levy budget of (\$42,789) and the sewer surcharge budget of (\$18,845).

TRAFFIC OPERATIONS:

Temporary salaries in Traffic Operation's Sign and Pavement Markings and Streetlight Divisions are budgeted for the hiring of students to assist in the completion of work in the divisions including paint of:

- Yellow centre lines and white lane lines
- Crosswalks and stop bars at signalized intersections
- Crosswalks with school crossing guards
- Railroad crossings
- Right and left turn arrows
- Various other symbols such as designated bike lanes

Currently, there is one student who works with the sign crew (5 FTE with 1 Student) who complete sign maintenance and installation of new signage. If the temporary salary budget (students) were to be eliminating, the sign maintenance would continue to be completed by existing FTE's. The departments ability to support new installations and other capital projects would be compromised as the remaining existing FTE's would not be able to complete both maintenance and new sign installation.

Currently, there is one four-person crew completing painting of long lines (2 FTE's with 2 Students), and four three-person crews completing crosswalks (1FTE with 2 Students) as well as other markings completed using the walk behind paint machine. If the temporary salary budget (students) were to be eliminated, the long line painting would continue to be completed by existing FTE's. Crosswalks and all other markings would need to be assigned to the only other crew

available. It is doubtful that signalized intersections and crosswalks could be completed by the remaining crew, and all other markings would no longer be completed. Exposure to significant liability will occur as the many markings around the City would no longer be maintained as per the Ontario Traffic Manuals requirements.

Currently, there are 2 students working with the Engineer II to complete the streetlight pole inspection program. This program began in 2021 with capital funding spanning two years. The capital project will continue with capital maintenance funding. The elimination of students would increase the cost to complete the program using FTE staff and potentially staff would not be able to complete the inspection in the two-year time frame.

Elimination of students for the Markings, Signs, and Streetlighting Divisions of Traffic Operations would result in an overall reduction to the municipal levy budget of (\$128,608).

ON-OFF STREET PARKING:

Currently there are two students working with one FTE to maintain the landscaping and overall look of the parking lots. They collect garbage, trim hedges, cut grass, and sweep up debris. The elimination of students would mean a reduced level of service for parkers in each of the lots.

Elimination of students for the On-Off Street Parking Division would result in an offsetting increase to the annual budgeted transfer to the On-Off Street Parking Reserve fund of \$20,023. The balance in the On-Off Street Parking Reserve Fund as at December 31, 2022 was \$1,957,022.

FLEET:

Students are hired twice during the year to complete an audit of the City's CVOR documentation. As an owner/operator of commercial motor vehicles, the City of Windsor and its drivers are required to comply with the laws and regulations that apply to the operation of trucks and buses in Ontario. The Highway Traffic Act - Ont. Reg. 555/06 requires the completion of a daily log each day that accounts for all of the driver's on-duty and off-duty time for the day. This audit involves verifying a 6 month supply of driving records are on file for each employee who drives a commercial motor vehicle in order to be in compliance with the Highway Traffic Act. Failure to complete a daily/weekly record accurately is an offence and may be fined by the Ministry of Transportation. The Fleet Division does not have the resources to audit these records, therefore, relies on students to complete this task. Elimination of students would result in the elimination of these audits and exposure to fines by the Ministry of Transportation.

Furthermore, students provide shop and fuel site maintenance work such as fueling, washing vehicles, cleaning the shop, transferring vehicles, picking up parts and painting at fuel sites. Elimination of the students will result in a more costly approach to completing these tasks.

Elimination of students for the Fleet Division would result in an overall reduction to the municipal levy budget of (\$37,417).

MAINTENANCE:

In the Maintenance Division, elimination of students would result in no pothole patching from May - August, unless responding to a damage claim. The cleaning of catch basins and external sewer areas would also be adversely impacted, potentially resulting in increased liability for the City. Additionally, specifically in ROW Road/Alley Maintenance, the elimination of students proposed would also result in reductions for asphalt materials and three dump trucks. The service of this area is critical to the maintenance of the City's infrastructure. The reduction or elimination of this budget would result in increases in road hazards and subsequent liability to the City. In addition, the City would experience a reduction in road longevity and an increase in road flooding. Overall, public trust would decrease as personal property damage increases and public safety is impacted.

Elimination of students for the Maintenance Division would result in overall reductions to the municipal levy budget of (\$255,310) and to the sewer surcharge budget of (\$42,924).

Should this issue be accepted by Council, the following issues will require recalculation to exclude students:

- 2024-0154 - Increase for Temporary Wages
- 2024-0166 - Elimination or Reduction of Road and Alley Maintenance
- 2024-0168 - Elimination of BIA Maintenance
- 2024-0167 - Elimination or Reduction of Concrete Maintenance

Alternatively, should Council wish to proceed with a reduction of student labour, Administration would prioritize the

services provided by students and reduce accordingly to accommodate the approved budget reduction.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	(51,721)				
PW Maintenance	Hourly-Temporary	(153,780)				
PW Maintenance	Infrastructure Maint. Material	(64,000)				
PW Maintenance	VehicleRent-Dedicated INTERNAL	(62,000)				
PW Maintenance (Sewer Surcharge)	TRANSFER to Current Fund				(42,925)	
Environmental Services	Hourly-Temporary	(55,031)				
Environmental Services (Sewer Surcharge)	TRANSFER to Current Fund				(18,846)	
Fleet	Hourly-Temporary	(13,571)				
Fleet	Salary-Temporary	(19,153)				
On-Off Street Parking	Salary-Temporary	(22,516)				
On-Off Street Parking (Prkg Reserve)	TRANSFER to Current Fund			(26,119)		
Technical Support	Salary-Temporary	(30,206)				
Technical Support (Sewer Surcharge)	TRANSFER to Current Fund				(17,520)	
Traffic Operations	Infrastructure Maint. Material	(18,500)				
Traffic Operations	Salary-Temporary	(84,576)				
Traffic Operations	VehicleRent-TempOther INTERNAL	(12,000)				
	Total Expenses	(587,054)	0	(26,119)	(79,291)	0
PW Maintenance	Sewer Surcharge Recoveries	42,925				
Environmental Services	Sewer Surcharge Recoveries	18,846				
On-Off Street Parking	On/Off Str Pkg-Intrnl Recovery	26,119				
Technical Support	Sewer Surcharge Recoveries	17,520				
	Total Revenues	105,410	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(481,644)	0	(26,119)	(79,291)	0

2024 Budget Issue Detail



Budget Issue #	2024-0106	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Public Works	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Fleet	Status	Public

Eliminate Washing of City Fleet

This issue reflects the elimination of the washing of the City fleet. This would increase the wear and tear on vehicles and decrease the resale values.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

Powerwashing of the city fleet was awarded to a new vendor in 2021 and there has been a decrease in the cost of this service.

Leaving vehicles exposed to the elements, as well as particles such as dust and salt which attach themselves to the paint and finish of vehicles, leaves them unprotected and vulnerable to additional wear and tear. Fleet washes maintain and preserve a vehicle's finish which contributes to a better Corporate public appearance as well as higher resale or trade-in values. The Fleet Division utilizes a contracted mobile wash service to wash the City fleet at various locations. For vehicles requiring washing that are not at one of these locations, operators wash their vehicles at selected local car wash locations.

5-Year Trend Analysis (Wash Account):

Year	Budget	Actuals	Variance	
2019	\$15,000	\$3,358	\$11,642	surplus
2020	\$16,194	\$26,989	(\$10,795)	deficit
2021	\$16,194	\$41,558	(\$25,364)	deficit
2022	\$16,479	\$27,214	(\$10,735)	deficit
2023 *projected	\$16,479	\$16,479	(\$10,000)	* projected deficit

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fleet	Fleet Car Washes	(16,479)				
	Total Expenses	(16,479)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(16,479)	0	0	0	0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0168	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[2] Budget Reduction
Department	Public Works	Category	[L] Service Elimination
Division	Contracts, Field Services & Maintenance	Status	Public

Elimination of BIA Maintenance

This issue reflects the elimination of BIA Maintenance critical to infrastructure located in BIAs. This elimination would result in increased liability costs to the City, damage to public trust, and increased personal property damage and public safety issues.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The service elimination for BIA maintenance would have direct effect on public safety and public trust.

The BIA services include:

- Interlock brick strip hazard maintenance
- BIA furniture maintenance
- BIA Planter (structure) maintenance

The service of this area is critical to infrastructure located in the BIAs. The elimination of this budget would result in an increase in liability costs to the city and would damage public trust resulting in personal property damage and public safety issues.

The current budget of \$16,394 related to a portion of a Local 82 position's wage and fringe and a portion of a dedicated equipment rental has not been submitted for reduction under this service elimination. The budgets related to these costs would be reallocated to enhance a different program within the Maintenance Division should this budget submission be accepted, as a portion of a position or piece of equipment cannot be reduced.

The balance in the BIA Maintenance Reserve Account 1785 as at December 31, 2022 is \$23,158.35. This reserve is funded via the transfer of year-end surpluses to the account.

Should this budget reduction be accepted, the related temporary wage adjustments included in the following issues would not be required:

- 2024-0102 Elimination of Students
- 2024-0154 Increase in Temporary Wage Budgets

5-Year Trend Analysis (BIA Maintenance):

Year	Budget	Actual	Variance	
2019	\$91,818	\$19,203	\$72,615 surplus	Transferred to Reserve
2020	\$65,602	\$278,128	(\$212,526)	Transferred from Reserve
2021	\$37,801	\$43,343	(\$5,542)	Transferred from Reserve
2022	\$37,803	\$24,340	\$13,463 surplus	Transferred to Reserve

2023 *projected	\$38,813	\$38,813	\$0	* projected
-----------------	----------	----------	-----	-------------

Note: In addition to regular scheduled maintenance in the BIA's for 2020, interlock bricks repairs were completed in the downtown BIA which resulted in an over expenditure of the annual operating budget and a transfer into operating from the BIA reserve for the year.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	(408)				
PW Maintenance	Contracted Services	(15,000)				
PW Maintenance	Hourly-Temporary	(3,374)				
PW Maintenance	Infrastructure Maint. Material	(3,500)				
	Total Expenses	(22,282)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	(22,282)	0	0	0	0

Budget Issue #	2024-0103	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Infrastructure Services	Classification	[3] Budget Enhancement
Department	Public Works	Category	[M] Service Enhancement
Division	Environmental Services	Status	Public

Enhanced Street Sweeping Services

This issue proposes required budget increases to allow the Environmental department to achieve target service levels for street sweeping on an annual basis. Target levels were not met for the two years prior to the COVID-19 pandemic as our City continues to develop, and trees in established neighborhoods continue to mature. Targets of three sweeps for residential streets and seven sweeps for arterial or collector streets annually will not be met on a consistent basis without the addition of two full time staff and an additional street sweeper truck at an annual cost of \$279,485 funded from the sewer surcharge reserve. In January 2021, City Council endorsed the Stormwater Financing Study (Council Report C243/2020, CR42/2021) which will include expanding the street sweeping service.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: n/a

Issue Detail

The City of Windsor has four street sweepers in its established fleet. These sweepers operate both day and night between the months of April and November. Since these units have a water-based operation, they cannot operate when the weather is below 0 degrees Celsius.

The current service level target for residential streets is three times per year: once in the spring, once in the summer and once in the fall. Collector and arterial roads have a service level of seven times per year, while all BIAs are serviced weekly.

In January 2021, City Council endorsed the Stormwater Financing Study (Council Report C243/2020, Council Decision CR42/2021) which included the following key elements: segregation of stormwater from wastewater funding; proposed level of service (LOS) program and five-year phase-in period for an enhanced future stormwater program; and a new user-fee funding model. Within this Study, expanding the street sweeping contracts and labour was identified on the list of priority program needs that will be included as part of the program LOS improvements. During the 2025 budget process, this LOS increase will again be reviewed and updated based on current City needs and brought to council for approval.

For the last five years, Administration has successfully met the targets for collector and arterial roads, but has failed to meet the target for residential streets all five years and only achieved two sweeps those years. This year, once more it is anticipated that most residential streets will only receive two sweeps before year's end.

The reason residential streets have not received the targeted three sweeps per year is due to the following:

1. Despite the increase in homes, roads and mature trees in the City of Windsor, the street sweeping fleet has not increase. This is particularly problematic during the fall once the leaves have fallen. There is very little time to clean up each street before the weather prohibits the use of the street sweepers.
2. Street sweepers are high maintenance units that require frequent servicing. It is not uncommon to have one sweeper out of service for maintenance at any given time. Therefore, although the City has four units in its fleet, only three are typically in service at any given time.
3. Alternate side parking causes a productivity issue. In order to complete one full sweep of a street with alternate side parking, we need to attend twice. Alternate side parking is often the preferred parking structure, and therefore the

number of roads with alternate side parking has continuously increased.

4. Due to the need to adhere to noise restrictions, residential streets can only be serviced during the day shift. Since street sweeping is not an essential service that municipalities are mandated to provide, other critical operations that are in a staffing deficit will utilize street sweeping staff to fill the gap, thereby leaving the street sweeper idle.

5. The fall sweep is particularly challenging. As mentioned earlier, many neighborhoods in the City of Windsor enjoy beautiful mature trees. This unfortunately means that when the trees lose their foliage, all the streets in Windsor require servicing at the same time. There is simply not enough equipment to complete all the streets before the temperature forces the cessation of operations.

Administration conducted a survey of comparator municipalities regarding their street sweeping services. Below is a summary of those that responded.

	Quinte West	Barrie	Kingston	Hamilton	Windsor
Kilometer of paved roadway	1444	1586	1747	6454	2348
Household	17,830	54,661	54,198	237,200	99,521
Service level target (residential)	1x annually	1x annually	3x annually	Monthly	3x annually
In-house/contracted service	Both	In-house only	In-house only	In-house only	In -house only
# of Street Sweeping units	Unknown	8	4	20	4
# of Km per unit to complete 1 sweep	Unknown	198 km/unit	436 km/unit	322km/unit	587 km/unit

Although only four municipalities responded to the survey, the information does provide some insight. Firstly, the service level targets for residential streets of three times annually appears to be within the norm. Quinte West and Barrie have lower frequencies, but are smaller cities than the City of Windsor.

Secondly, the use of in-house service dominated all municipalities, with only Quinte West using contracted services to supplement their in-house operations. However, at the time of this report, any additional detailed information on this model was not available.

Lastly, the number of units used in each municipality varied wildly, but when looked at in terms of the number of kilometers per unit needed to complete one sweep, it is evident that Windsor is the least favorable, requiring each sweeper to sweep 587 km, while Kingston required only 436 km and Hamilton 322 km. Kingston and Hamilton both reported being able to meet their targets 75% of the time. This would suggest that should Windsor wish to increase its ability to reach its residential street sweeping targets, then additional resources would be needed.

Additional resources can be obtained in three different manners:

Option 1 (recommended option) would be to add a street sweeper and 2 FTEs to the operations. This would allow for an additional sweeper to be deployed 6 days a week, throughout the year (when temperatures are above freezing).

Option 2 would be to establish a contract with private sector forces to supplement the existing in-house forces, during peak seasons. This option would require discussions with the union as per Article 27 of the Collective Agreement.

Option 3 would be to purchase a vacuum unit attachment for the existing roll off vehicle that could be used to expedite fall clean up in the heavy tree areas of the City of Windsor.

Risk:

Failure to increase our ability to meet the established target service levels will contribute to increased street flooding, increased sewer maintenance issues, and increased sewage treatment costs. Street sweeping not only contributes to a positive City image, but is vital in reducing on street flooding and sewer maintenance.

Increasing in-house services would give the City the greatest flexibility as units can be deployed or reassigned in the most optimal scenario since the department has an established 6 day a week operation both on day and night shifts. Contracted services are typically more restrictive, or have a premium charge for afternoon, night or weekend shifts.

Financial:

Option 1 (recommended option) outlines the costs to add a street sweeper and 2 FTE to the department complement. This will allow the department to meet targets of 3 sweeps a year for residential roads on a more consistent basis, at an annual sewer surcharge cost of \$279,485 and one-time capital cost of \$540,000 to purchase the sweeper unit. This option also provides the greatest flexibility and control in terms of scheduling, prioritizing and providing support for other operations.

Option 2 outlines the cost of contractor services for street sweeping. The cost of contractor services for street sweeping under the existing Heavy Equipment Tender ranges from \$130/hr to \$185/hr. In comparison, the hourly operating cost for in-house service is \$100/ hr. A tender for contracted seasonal street sweeping services would require 2 months of service in the spring and 2 months of service in the fall, for a total of approximately 960 hours. Therefore, we can expect that a contract supplemental service may cost in the range of \$124,800 to \$177,600. However, it should be noted that this cost estimate may be understated as the rates above based on occasional use only of a sweeper. More frequent use to meet our service level targets would require a more dedicated unit which may affect the hourly rate.

Option 3 outlines the cost to add a vacuum unit to the dedicated equipment. This unit would be an attachment for the existing Roll off truck and be used during that truck's idle time with existing staffing levels. This unit would only assist in the fall clean up for heavy leaf areas of the City and would not guarantee a full 3rd sweep. It would however significantly expedite the fall clean up. It is estimated that a one-time capital cost of \$120,000 would be required to purchase the vacuum unit.

Capital Budget Implication

Should Option 1 be approved, an additional street sweeper would be required and would be purchased through the Capital Fleet Additions project OPS-022-07 at a cost of approximately \$540,000. This unit would be included in the dedicated fleet with appropriate depreciation contributed to the Fleet Replacement Reserve #136 to fund future replacements.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Salary & Wage Adjust Provision	Fringe Benefit Allocation	44,138				
Environmental Services	Hourly-Reg.Full Time	133,748				
Environmental Services	VehicleRent-Dedicated INTERNAL	101,600				
Environmental Services (Sewer Surcharge)	TRANSFER to Current Fund				279,486	
Fleet	Depreciation	53,847				
Fleet	Licenses	431				
Fleet	Motor Fuels	5,523				
Fleet	Vehicle Maint Parts/Materials	5,105				
Fleet	Vehicle Repairs	36,694				
	Total Expenses	381,086	0	0	279,486	0
Environmental Services	Sewer Surcharge Recoveries	(279,486)				

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Fleet	Lease & Rental Revenue	(101,600)				
	Total Revenues	(381,086)	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	0	0	0	279,486	0

Department	Dept ID	Position Title	Employee Class	FTE
Public Works	Environmental Services	Facility Operator	Regular Full-Time	2.0
Total:				2.0

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

In-Camera Issue
(This Page Was Left Blank Intentionally)

Budget Issue #	2024-0180	Stage	Recommended
CLT Office	Corporate	Classification	[1] Budget Increase
Department	Corporate Accounts	Category	[E] Inflationary
Division	Fund Transfers	Status	Public

Increase in Contribution from Operating to Capital

Reflects increased annual contribution to the Capital Budget in order to help maintain purchasing power relative to the Capital Program. Given the ever-present challenge of inflation, the City's annual contribution toward growth-related projects needs to keep pace. No increase in funding will result in fewer growth-related capital projects being completed each year as the City's purchasing power continues to erode due to increasing construction costs.

Recommendation: Not Recommended

One-Time Funding: N/A

Issue Detail

The City currently contributes an average of \$31,550,000 each year toward growth-related projects, such as the expansion of roads, new Park and Recreation facilities, as well as other infrastructure required as the City continues to grow.

As City Council is aware, the City, similar to other municipalities, continues to face the ever-present challenge of inflation. The \$31,550,000 annual contribution towards growth-related projects was established as part of the 2020 Capital Budget, when a split between growth-related and maintenance-related funding was introduced to integrate recommendations made in the 2018 Asset Management Plan. The 2024 Capital Budget was developed under the premise that this level of funding would remain unchanged up to and including the 2033 funding year.

Keeping growth-related spending at the current level of funding will result in the City being able to complete fewer and fewer growth-related projects each year as inflation continues to erode the City's purchasing power. While inflation reported by the Bank of Canada was reported to be in excess of 8% in June 2022, the long-term target of the Bank of Canada is in the 1-3% range. If the City experiences 2% inflation until 2033, the \$31,550,000 received in 2033 will only purchase \$25,778,647 in today's dollars, a reduction of 18.3% in purchasing power.

Administration is recommending an increase to the annual contribution of 5%, or \$1,577,500. While the long-term target of inflation is in the 1-3% range, the lost purchasing power between 2020, when the contribution funding level was established, and now, is well in excess of this figure. Without this increase, the City's ability to construct infrastructure to support the City's growth will be severely impaired.

Dept ID	GL Account	Municipal Levy	Building Permit Reserve	Off Street Parking Reserve	Sewer Surcharge Reserve	Storm Water Reserve
Contribution To Capital	TRANSFER to Reserve Fund	1,577,500				
	Total Expenses	1,577,500	0	0	0	0
	Net Total	1,577,500	0	0	0	0